



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Date: February 6, 2014

To: Brian Kischnick, City Manager

From: Mark F. Miller, Director of Economic & Community Development
MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager
Cathleen Russ, Library Director
Andrew Opalewski, Marketing Coordinator

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award - Wayfinding Consultant Services for the Troy Public Library

History

In 2012, the Troy Public Library conducted a study that led to the development of the Library's 2013-2015 Strategic Plan. A priority action item of the Library's Strategic Plan is to "make it easier for users to navigate the Library – finding materials and finding places (computer area, youth area, restrooms, etc.) – through effective signage, low-cost reorganization and increased staff interaction" (Objective 2.1). In turn, Library administration finds it necessary to seek an experienced Wayfinding Consultant to develop a comprehensive signage system that specifically facilitates Wayfinding throughout the Library and the Library parking lot so as to enhance patrons' sense of direction and evoking imagery to strengthen the identity and image of the Library and its services.

The Wayfinding Consultant Service utilizing Wayfinding Design Principles will:

- Address the needs of visitors and residents as stated in the Library's Strategic Plan
- Create intuitive, legible signage that is direct, welcoming, accessible and focused on safety.
- The system will be adaptable to future Library needs.
- The analysis will include a variety of signage and reorganizational needs including, but not limited to:
 - Kiosks/Information Centers
 - Room Identification Signage
 - Directional and Identification Signage for Library Materials
 - Materials Return and Drop-off Signage
 - Minor or non-costly materials or room reorganization
 - Public Parking Signage
 - Vehicular Directional Signage

The project is limited to the City of Troy Library building (55,000 sq ft., 45,000 of which is public and staff space), the Library grounds, the Library's vehicular entrance and parking lot. Phase 2 Wayfinding Signage would include the City Hall Complex in the future.

Purchasing

On December 19, 2013, a bid opening was conducted as required by City Charter and Code for Wayfinding Consultant Services for the City of Troy Public Library. The bid was posted on the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) website; www.mitn.info and the bid was also sent to the Troy Chamber of Commerce. Four (4) bid proposal responses were received. Below is a detailed summary of potential vendors:



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

Companies notified via MITN	596
Troy Companies notified via MITN	20
Troy Companies notified Active email Notification	20
Troy Companies notified Active Free	0
Companies that viewed the bid	65
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	2

MITN provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy.

Active MITN members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City.

Active MITN non-paying members are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City.

Inactive MITN member status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.

Proposals were evaluated as per the Request for Proposal; Section 3: Criteria for Selection. The Wayfinding Consultant Services Evaluation Committee members were as follows:

- Cathy Russ, Library Director
- Justin Beyer, Assistant to the Library Director
- Andrew Opalewski, Marketing Coordinator
- Steve Pallotta, Building Operations Director
- MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager
- Enna Bachelor, Buyer

The evaluation committee reviewed proposals to determine the most qualified firm based upon a combination of factors including but not limited to the following:

- A. Compliance with qualifications criteria
- B. Completeness of the proposal
- C. Financial strength and capacity of the company
- D. Correlation of the proposals submitted to the needs of the City of Troy
- E. Any other factors which may be deemed to be in the City's best interest
- F. Evaluation Process

Firms were then evaluated and scored based on:

- 40% Proposal Score
- 20% Interview Score
- ~~40%~~ Price Score
- 100%

Based on the evaluation process and the final scoring KMA Design was ranked the highest of the four (4) proposals received. KMA Design provided the most complete detailed proposal which included a detailed project timeline. KMA Design as evaluated was also the most creative in terms of signage application and specifically has experience with Libraries.

KMA's design approach includes for (4) phases as listed below. For detailed description of each Phase see Attachment A.

- Phase 1 Analysis
- Phase 2 System Design Development
- Phase 3 Pre-Production
- Phase 4 Implementation



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Financial

In order to accomplish this objective, \$20,000 in the 2013-14 Budget was allocated towards hiring a Wayfinding Consultant. Funds are available in the Library's operating budget, 271.790.7816.010 Consultant Services.

Recommendation

City management and the Wayfinding Consultant Services Committee recommend awarding the contract to furnish Wayfinding Consultant Services for the City of Troy Public Library to the best value proposer; KMA Design of Carnegie, PA for an estimated total cost of \$18,105.00, at unit prices contained in the bid tabulation opened December 19, 2013. The project shall be completed as detailed by the timeline which was also included in the proposal and is included with this recommendation.

VENDOR NAME:	Corbin Design Traverse City, MI	Nicolson & Associates Bloomfield Hills, MI
--------------	---	--

PROPOSAL: To Furnish Professional Wayfinding Analysis and Consultant Services for the City of Troy Public Library; in accordance with Request for Proposal specifications and scope of work.

DESCRIPTION:	Staff				Approx. Hrs.	\$ Cost/Hr.	Total Cost		Approx. Hrs.	\$ Cost/Hr.	Total Cost
Phase 1: Analysis											
Library Building	Senior Designer	40	\$120.00	\$ 4,800.00	Research/Learning	12	\$100.00	\$ 1,200.00			
	Project Manager	44	\$105.00	\$ 4,620.00	Analysis/Planning	48	\$100.00	\$ 4,800.00			
	Reimbursable			\$ 1,185.00	Deliverables/Preso.	12	\$100.00	\$ 1,200.00			
Library Building Total				\$10,605.00							\$ 7,200.00
Library Grounds, Parking Lot, Vehicular Entrance	Senior Designer	14	\$120.00	\$ 1,680.00	Analysis/Planning	32	\$100.00	\$ 3,200.00			
	Project Manager	14	\$105.00	\$ 1,470.00							
Library Grounds, Parking Lot, Vehicular Entrance Total				\$ 3,150.00							\$ 3,200.00
Total Phase 1: Analysis				\$13,755.00							\$10,400.00
Phase 2: System Design Development											
	Senior Designer	108	\$ 120.00	\$12,960.00	Conceptual Design	32	\$100.00	\$ 3,200.00			
	Project Manager	34	\$ 105.00	\$ 3,570.00	Design Development	24	\$100.00	\$ 2,400.00			
	Reimbursables			\$ 1,300.00							
Total Phase 2: System Design Development				\$17,830.00							\$ 5,600.00
Phase 3: Pre-Production											
	Senior Designer	68	\$ 120.00	\$ 8,160.00	Pre-Production	16	\$100.00	\$ 1,600.00			
	Project Manager	52	\$ 105.00	\$ 5,460.00							
	Reimbursables			\$ 1,225.00							
Total Phase 3: Pre-Production				\$14,845.00							\$ 1,600.00
Phase 4: Implementation											
	Professional Fees			\$15,120.00	Fabrication Admin.	12	\$100.00	\$ 1,200.00			
	Reimbursables			\$ 1,280.00	Reference Manual	16	\$ 80.00	\$ 1,280.00			
Total Phase 4: Implementation				\$16,400.00							\$ 2,480.00
					Preso. Materials	1		\$ 600.00			
Grand Total:		374		\$62,830.00		205		\$20,680.00			

VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
INSURANCE:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
INDEMNIFICATION REQUIREMENTS:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
CONTACT INFORMATION:		Shelley Steele 231 947 1236	Richard Nicholson 248 207 3921
PAYMENT TERMS:		30 Days	30 Days
REFERENCES:		Yes	Yes
EXCEPTIONS:		None	None
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: Signed	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
Forms (5)	Yes/No	Yes	Yes

ATTEST:
Enna Bachelor
Cathy Russ
Justin Beyer

Bold Type Indicates:

 MaryBeth Murz,
 Purchasing Manager

VENDOR NAME:

**KMA Design
 Carnegie, PA**

**TakeForm
 Medina, NY**

PROPOSAL: To Furnish Professional Wayfinding Analysis and Consultant Services for the City of Troy Public Library; in accordance with Request for Proposal specifications and scope of work.

DESCRIPTION:		Approx.	\$ Cost/Hr.	Total Cost	Staff	Approx.	\$ Cost/Hr.	Total Cost
		Hrs.				Hrs.		
Phase 1: Analysis								
Library Building	Tasks as detailed	24.5	\$ 85.61	\$ 2,097.50	Assessment			\$ 2,500.00
	Total Expenses			\$ 1,425.00	Travel/expenses			\$ 750.00
Library Building Total								\$ 3,250.00
Library Grounds, Parking Lot, Vehicular Entrance					Assessment			\$ 1,000.00
Library Grounds, Parking Lot, Vehicular Entrance Total					Travel/expenses			\$ 750.00
Total Phase 1: Analysis				\$ 3,522.50				\$ 5,000.00
Phase 2: System Design Development								
	Tasks as detailed	49.25	\$ 79.47	\$ 3,913.75	Develop design concepts			\$ 5,700.00
	Total Expenses			\$ 1,519.50	Design revisions (up to 5)			
Total Phase 2: System Design Development				\$ 5,433.25				\$ 5,700.00
Phase 3: Pre-Production								
	Tasks as detailed	41	\$ 77.44	\$ 3,175.00	Const. drawings, spec bid pkge.			\$ 1,875.00
	Total Expenses			\$ 1,429.75	Travel expense, bid eval/			\$ 1,500.00
Total Phase 3: Pre-Production				\$ 4,604.75				\$ 3,375.00
Phase 4: Implementation								
	Tasks as detailed	39	\$ 85.26	\$ 3,282.50	Attend install, develop punch list			\$ 1,500.00
	Total Expenses			\$ 1,262.00				
Total Phase 4: Implementation				\$ 4,544.50				\$ 1,500.00
Grand Total:		153		\$18,105.00				\$15,575.00

VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
INSURANCE:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
INDEMNIFICATION REQUIREMENTS:	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
CONTACT INFORMATION:		Barbara J. Martin 412 429 4071	Bill Hungerford 585 318 1017
PAYMENT TERMS:		Net 30	Net 30
REFERENCES:		Yes	Yes
EXCEPTIONS:		Yes	None
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: Signed	Yes/No	Yes	Yes
Forms (5)	Yes/No	Yes	Yes

ATTEST:
Enna Bachelor
Cathy Russ
Justin Beyer

Bold Type Indicates:

 MaryBeth Murz,
 Purchasing Manager

Name	Start	Finish	Qtr 4, 2013	Qtr 1, 2014	Qtr 2, 2014	Qtr 3, 2014	Qtr 4, 2014							
			Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep
1	Troy Public Library - Phase I: Analysis	02/18/2014	02/28/2014											
2	Kick-off Meeting	02/18/2014	02/18/2014											
3	Document Existing Conditions	02/18/2014	02/18/2014											
4	Survey staff for existing/potential wayfinding difficulties	02/18/2014	02/18/2014											
5	Determine maintenance, budget, schedule and phasing issues	02/19/2014	02/19/2014											
6	Review 2013-2015 strategic plan	02/19/2014	02/19/2014											
7	Review graphic standards manual and relevant documents	02/19/2014	02/19/2014											
8	Review and organize guidelines from regulatory codes	02/20/2014	02/20/2014											
9	Recommend sign types to be added, replaced or consolidated	02/20/2014	02/20/2014											
10	Develop list of sign types, terminology and design icons	02/20/2014	02/25/2014											
11	Determine key destinations and review circulation patterns	02/20/2014	02/28/2014											
12	Create a map of recommended sign locations	02/20/2014	02/28/2014											
13	Determine preliminary wayfinding logic	02/24/2014	02/28/2014											
14	Identify current trends in signage	02/26/2014	02/28/2014											
15	Provide recommendations for flexible and maintainable materials	02/26/2014	02/28/2014											
16	Identify technologies and materials for electronic signage	02/26/2014	02/28/2014											
17	Prepare a statement of probable costs	02/26/2014	02/28/2014											
18	Present Wayfinding Analysis and Recommendations Document	02/27/2014	02/27/2014											
19	Incorporate changes and re-submit for approval	02/28/2014	02/28/2014											
20	Owner approval	02/27/2014	02/28/2014											
21	Troy Public Library - Phase II: System Design Development	03/03/2014	04/04/2014											
22	Recommend design elements reflective of Library's identity	03/03/2014	03/07/2014											
23	Develop preliminary location plans	03/03/2014	03/07/2014											
24	Prepare preliminary message schedule	03/03/2014	03/07/2014											
25	Prepare three design options for the primary sign types	03/03/2014	03/07/2014											
26	Prepare cost estimates for all design options	03/05/2014	03/07/2014											
27	Present schematic design options	03/10/2014	03/10/2014											
28	Incorporate changes and resubmit for approval	03/11/2014	03/13/2014											
29	Owner approval of chosen design concept	03/11/2014	03/13/2014											
30	Modify and develop chosen design scheme	03/17/2014	03/28/2014											
31	Provide up to two rounds of sign revisions via email	03/24/2014	03/28/2014											
32	Coordination with regulatory agencies	03/24/2014	03/28/2014											
33	Prepare mockups, prototypes and samples	03/24/2014	03/28/2014											
34	Update location plans and message schedules	03/24/2014	04/03/2014											
35	Revise cost estimates	03/24/2014	03/28/2014											
36	Present Design Development package to signage committee	03/27/2014	03/27/2014											
37	Incorporate owner changes and resubmit	03/28/2014	03/28/2014											
38	Owner approval	03/31/2014	04/04/2014											
39	Troy Public Library - Phase III: Pre-Production	04/07/2014	05/02/2014											
40	Finalize construction details	04/07/2014	04/18/2014											
41	Prepare second round of message schedule & location plan	04/14/2014	04/18/2014											
42	Prepare phasing, management and maintenance plan	04/11/2014	04/11/2014											
43	Obtain final approval from regulatory agencies	04/17/2014	04/18/2014											
44	Prepare construction specifications	04/16/2014	04/16/2014											
45	Prepare construction document package	04/21/2014	04/21/2014											
46	Incorporate changes and resubmit	04/22/2014	04/25/2014											
47	Issue construction documents to owner	04/25/2014	04/25/2014											
48	Owner approval	04/28/2014	05/02/2014											
49	Troy Public Library - Phase IV: Implementation	05/05/2014	09/30/2014											
50	Assist owner in issuing contract documents to bidders	05/05/2014	05/07/2014											
51	Attend pre-bid meeting	05/12/2014	05/12/2014											
52	Answer RFI's and issue addenda	05/09/2014	05/16/2014											
53	Assist owner in analyzing bids and substitutions	05/19/2014	05/19/2014											
54	Value engineer as necessary	05/20/2014	05/20/2014											
55	Hold pre-construction meeting via conference call	05/23/2014	05/23/2014											
56	Review of shop drawings and samples	06/02/2014	06/13/2014											
57	Review and respond to contractor's RFI's	05/26/2014	06/25/2014											
58	Observe fabrication to assure compliance with bid documents	07/01/2014	08/25/2014											
59	Observe design elements before and during installation	08/26/2014	09/02/2014											
60	Verify locations and review conditions with contractor	09/03/2014	09/10/2014											
61	Observe installation to ensure contract document compliance	09/15/2014	09/15/2014											
62	Observe installation to ensure compliance with install schedule	09/15/2014	09/15/2014											
63	Final Review (punchlist)	09/17/2014	09/17/2014											
64	Aid owner in resolution of punchlist items	09/15/2014	09/29/2014											
65	Owner approval	09/30/2014	09/30/2014											
66	Project closeout	09/30/2014	09/30/2014											

