

The Special/Study Meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Strat at 7:31 p.m. on September 27, 2005 in the Council Chambers of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Gary Chamberlain
Lynn Drake-Batts
Fazal Khan
Robert Schultz
Thomas Strat
Mark J. Vleck
David T. Waller
Wayne Wright

Absent:

Lawrence Littman

Also Present:

Mark F. Miller, Planning Director
Brent Savidant, Principal Planner
Allan Motzny, Assistant City Attorney
Christopher Kulesza, Student Representative
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

Resolution # PC-2005-09-147

Moved by: Schultz
Seconded by: Wright

RESOLVED, That Member Littman is excused from attendance at this meeting for personal reasons.

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Schultz announced that due to a personal matter, it might be necessary for him to exit the meeting occasionally to accept phone calls or leave the premises.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Chair Strat requested that the Agenda be revised to include reports from those members who attended the Michigan Association of Planning (MAP) conference.

Resolution # PC-2005-09-148

Moved by: Wright
Seconded by: Vleck

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as revised.

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED2. **MINUTES**

Mr. Wright asked that the September 13, 2005 Regular Meeting minutes reflect the following changes: Agenda Item #10, ZOTA 218, page 10, 3rd paragraph and under the Good of the Order, page 13, last paragraph – Reverse the numbering of ZOTA 218 and ZOTA 214.

Resolution # PC-2005-09-149

Moved by: Wright
Seconded by: Chamberlain

RESOLVED, To approve the September 13, 2005 Regular Meeting minutes as amended.

Yes: Chamberlain, Drake-Batts, Schultz, Strat, Vleck, Waller, Wright
No: None
Abstain: Khan
Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED3. **PUBLIC COMMENTS** (Items not on the Agenda)

There was no one present who wished to speak.

4. **BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS (BZA) REPORT**

Mr. Wright reported on the September 20, 2005 BZA meeting.

5. DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (DDA) REPORT

Mr. Miller reported on the September 21, 2005 DDA meeting. A Resolution to amend the boundaries of the Downtown Development Authority district, excluding the proposed Monarch Private Residences Planned Unit Development (PUD 4), was approved by the DDA. Mr. Miller indicated the Resolution was very lengthy and detailed, and he would provide a copy to the members either by e-mail or at the next Study Session meeting.

6. PLANNING AND ZONING REPORT

Mr. Miller requested that this item be deferred to the October 4, 2005 Special/Study Meeting.

ZONING ORDINANCE TEXT AMENDMENT

7. PUBLIC HEARING – ZONING ORDINANCE TEXT AMENDMENT (ZOTA 214) – Articles 04.20.00 and 10.30.00, Group Day Care Homes in the R-1A through R-1E Districts

Resolution # PC-2005-09-150

Moved by: Vleck
Seconded by: Schultz

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission hereby rescinds Resolution #PC-2005-08-131, which resolved that the Planning Commission take no further action on ZOTA 214 until the State Legislature and the Governor have taken final action on HB 4398.

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED

Ms. Drake-Batts questioned proposed language relating to a minimum square footage requirement for outdoor play areas.

Chair Strat said the members have not had an opportunity to discuss in detail the proposed verbiage provided by the Planning Department.

Mr. Vleck explained the procedure normally followed by the Planning Commission to reach consensus on proposed zoning ordinance text amendments. Mr. Vleck said the members have not had time to reach a consensus on proposed verbiage for consideration and approval by the City Council, and noted that tonight's Public Hearing was at the request of the City Council.

Chair Strat addressed the chart of Planning Commission actions, prepared by the Planning Department. He said the chart could be misleading to the City Council in that it appears the Planning Commission studied the verbiage in detail and at great length.

A brief discussion continued on the time the Planning Commission studied proposed verbiage.

Mr. Khan asked why City Management changed its stance to a position of neutrality on group day care homes.

Mr. Miller said initially City Management recommended that group day care homes not be permitted in residential areas because traffic statistics indicate that the impact of traffic generated from the number of trips to/from a group day care home would be beyond what normally occurs in a residential area. After further study, City Management determined that although the traffic would have an affect on the health, safety and welfare of residents, it would not be an immediate or dangerous affect. City Management decided group day care homes is a community value that needs to be determined via a recommendation from the Planning Commission and an ultimate decision by the City Council.

Mr. Schultz said it is unfortunate that City Management had not shared their change of position on the matter prior to this evening in which the Planning Commission was dictated to have a Public Hearing and requested to send a recommendation to the City Council.

Mr. Khan agreed.

Mr. Miller reviewed the number of responses received by the Planning Department in favor and in opposition to the proposed zoning ordinance text amendment since the August 9, 2005 Regular Meeting.

Mr. Vleck emphasized the procedure followed by the Planning Commission for proposed zoning ordinance text amendments, and indicated the members have not had sufficient time to discuss the proposed text on group day care homes. Mr. Vleck said, in his opinion, the members can either table the matter for further discussion and draft proposed text or send to the City Council a recommendation of no change to the Zoning Ordinance. He stated he has read all the public comment provided to him by the Planning Department, and will read all public comment received thereafter.

Mr. Schultz concurred with Mr. Vleck's comments, and asked speakers at tonight's Public Hearing to not repeat the same comments and information that was heard at the previous Public Hearing.

Chair Strat announced guidelines that would be utilized for the Public Hearing due to the size of the audience and the possible number of people who might wish to

speak: (1) a time limit of 3 minutes for each speaker and limited to speaking once; (2) repetitive comments are discouraged; (3) maintain professional image; and (4) no clapping. Chair Strat designated Vice Chair Schultz as the timekeeper.

Chair Strat asked the members for a vote of confidence on the guidelines established for the Public Hearing.

Resolution # PC-2005-09-151

Moved by: Wright

Seconded by: Waller

RESOLVED, To approve the procedures set forth for the Public Hearing.

Yes: All present (8)

No: None

Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Khan asked speakers to address specifically the proposed options and text prepared by City Management.

Mr. Waller asked everyone to consider that tonight's Public Hearing was called by City Management, not the Planning Commission; and reminded everyone that it was discussed at the August 9, 2005 Regular Meeting how the Planning Commission members were not prepared to vote on any proposed text.

Chair Strat commented on the professional booklet received by child care providers and the information received both in support and opposition of the proposed zoning ordinance text amendment. He said it is his opinion that the Zoning Ordinance would be amended, but it is necessary to review in detail the options prepared by City Management and regulations as relates to group day care homes. Chair Strat asked speakers to address those issues.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

David Schafer of 5593 Mandale, Troy, was present. Mr. Schafer noted that the Planning Commission members have asked speakers to limit their comments to the proposed language, with no assurances that the proposed amendment would go forward. He said that it is most likely that the Planning Commission members would still hear comments from speakers on the efficacy, validity and value of day care in Troy.

Nichol Childs of 1931 Atlas Court, Troy, was present. Ms. Childs highlighted statistics obtained from surveys distributed to group day care homes in Troy with respect to the number of families utilizing group day care, Troy residency, proximity

to residency, and outdoor play areas. Ms. Childs said the State requires a total of 400 square feet for outdoor play areas, not 400 square feet per child. She cited several quotes of the Mayor relating to existing and future jobs, future plans and redevelopment and diversification of existing land uses.

Curtis Childs of 1931 Atlas Court, Troy, was present. Mr. Childs highlighted a recent U.S. Department of Treasury report relating to the composition of the labor force. He addressed a Public Hearing held by the City of Farmington Hills Planning Commission with respect to day care providers, and quoted a comment from the City of Farmington Hills chairman, "Child care truly is not a business, it is a requirement of modern society." Mr. Childs commented on the City Management options as follows: Option 2 is good; Option 3 is reasonable other than the required 400 square feet of outdoor play area per child; and Option 4 should not even be an option. Mr. Childs cited statistics from the Michigan State Police relating to crashes on major thoroughfares within the City of Troy.

Kelsey Ciccone of 1336 Lamb Drive, Troy, was present. Ms. Ciccone, 12 years old, and her sister attended the group day care home operated by Sharon Schafer, from birth to a year ago. She asked the City to not take away the opportunity from other kids to have the love and attention that she and her sister had growing up at the Schafer home.

Tom Mason of 929 E. Third Street, Royal Oak, was present. Mr. Mason spoke in support of group day care homes. His children attend a home day care in Troy, and he and his wife are considering moving to Troy to be closer to the day care provider.

Sharon Schafer of 5593 Mandale, Troy, was present. Ms. Schafer addressed the options prepared by City Management, and noted that Option 1 is to stay "status quo" which would mean that group day care homes would be closed down. She shared the accomplishments of her three children that she believes is a reflection to friends, neighbors, day care families and the Troy school district. Ms. Schafer asked the City of Troy to have the vision to be leaders in the State of Michigan and show other cities that group day care homes are good for the State.

Patricia Rencher of 208 Mack Avenue, Detroit, was present. Ms. Rencher is the Vice President of Programs with the Detroit Urban League. Ms. Rencher said the program is administered by the State of Michigan through the U.S. Department of Agriculture to insure proper nutrition is followed by the 200-plus licensed day care providers. She noted that it is also their obligation to observe and report through announced and un-announced visits any violation of health and safety. Ms. Rencher expressed support for group day care homes as a viable choice to parents.

April Orselli of 894 Sylvanwood, Troy, was present. Ms. Orselli spoke in favor of group day care homes. She said allowing group day care homes would promote the City's motto.

Kim Duford of 3141 McClure, Troy, was present. Ms. Duford addressed the original proposed zoning ordinance text amendment, and said it was simple and should remain simple. Ms. Duford said child care providers responded to the Planning Commission's request for information in the form of a booklet based on facts and statistics that answered most of the Commission's questions and concerns. She noted that the Commission has heard from Troy residents who use child care services, Troy businesses, teachers, doctors and neighbors.

Kara White of 22640 Wildwood, St. Clair Shores, was present. Ms. White, Vice President of a Troy business, said it is very important for the City of Troy to have group day care providers as a day care option for businesses. She indicated parents like to have their children cared for near their workplace.

Syed Mohiuddin of 6150 Country Ridge Drive, Troy, was present. Mr. Mohiuddin spoke in support of home day care providers. He said home day care providers are not like typical commercial businesses, and have been recognized as legitimate home businesses by both the State and Federal governments.

Sharon Manning of 2651 E. Square Lake Road, Troy, was present. Ms. Manning said there is a need for quality day care, and suggested that existing group day care homes be grandfathered in. Ms. Manning asked that the proposed language address personal property taxes. She informed the members that she is the only group day care provider who is assessed personal property taxes.

Kathy McDonald of 196 Birchwood, Troy, was present. Ms. McDonald addressed group day care homes in comparison to adult foster care homes with respect to traffic, employees, and noise.

Deane Castilloux of 90 Chopin, Troy, was present. Ms. Castilloux, a family day care provider, is strongly against grandfathering in existing group day care homes because it would eliminate her option to expand into a group day care provider, and could potentially jeopardize her business with respect to fees charged for care.

Chris Komasara of 5287 Windmill, Troy, was present. Mr. Komasara compared traffic concerns related to group day care homes to the traffic generated from public schools located within residential subdivisions. Mr. Komasara spoke in support of group day care homes.

[Mr. Wright stated that the City has no control over public schools and cannot control the locations of public schools.]

[Mr. Miller noted that the Zoning Ordinance requires schools to be located on major thoroughfares, but public schools are exempt from the Zoning Ordinance.]

Barb Webb of 787 Marengo, Troy, was present. It is her understanding that there is a 14% greater demand for infant child care in Oakland County than there are

centers to care for infants. Ms. Webb asked that the members vote in favor of group day care homes.

Ramzi Daloo of 2016 Connolly Drive, Troy, was present. Mr. Daloo informed the members that his niece and nephew operate a day care center for approximately 110 children in Farmington Hills. His niece and nephew are very much in support of group day care homes. Mr. Daloo asked that consideration be given to the young families moving into the City of Troy, as older residents choose to leave.

John Bjelobrk of 5581 Mandale Drive, Troy, was present. Mr. Bjelobrk, a neighbor of a home day care provider, asked that home day care providers respect the space, feelings, lifestyle and freedom of their neighbors.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Mr. Vleck indicated he is not in receipt of information he requested from the State Building Department and Human Resources Department, and would like to study the item further. Mr. Vleck said a Study Session, not a formal Public Hearing, is the proper format for review and discussion of the item.

Mr. Khan addressed concerns with proposed language with respect to the requirement for outdoor play areas, employees, and site plan waivers. Mr. Khan said he is not ready to vote on the item.

Chair Strat said he personally is in favor of group day care homes, but recognizes that regulations must be stipulated in the Zoning Ordinance. Chair Strat said the item is of priority and would be more appropriately studied at an informal Study Session.

Resolution # PC-2005-09-152

Moved by: Vleck
Seconded by: Wright

WHEREAS, The State of Michigan as provided in Public Act 207 of 1921 and Public Act 285 of 1931 and subsequent changes thereto provides for city planning and authorizes Planning Commissions and their powers; and

WHEREAS, The City of Troy Planning Commission is empowered by the City of Troy Zoning Ordinance to approve matters coming before it and recommend to City Council, where City Council holds that approval power for themselves.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, To hold a Public Hearing for ZOTA 214 at the Planning Commission Regular Meeting in December and to expedite necessary actions to study this item in the next Planning Commission Study Session in October due to the following reasons:

WHEREAS, This Public Hearing was not initiated by the Planning Commission.

WHEREAS, This Planning Commission is not ready to send any recommendations to the City Council regarding ZOTA 214.

WHEREAS, Staff prepared the verbiage for the proposed ZOTA and the Planning Commission has had very limited discussion on the verbiage of the proposed ZOTA and a consensus as to any necessary changes to the ordinance language has not yet been reached by the Planning Commission.

WHEREAS, Although there may be intent, the status of House Bill No. 4398 has not changed.

WHEREAS, The previous Public Hearing held for by this Body was to get public information from both group day care operations and the neighbors within 300 feet from the existing group day care homes and use that information to help in the formation of any proposed ZOTA language.

WHEREAS, According to the City of Troy Assistant Attorney, Allan Motzny, City of Troy Director of Building and Zoning, Mark Stimac, and the State of Michigan Construction Codes and Fire Safety Department, any building or structure or portion thereof that is used for education, supervision or personal care services for more than five children older than 2-1/2 years of age would be classified as a Group E occupancy and would require the inspection by a State or City Building Inspector before that building could be used for that purpose.

WHEREAS, There is nothing within the child care licensing law that exempts these facilities from the Michigan Building Code provisions.

AND WHEREAS, we would request that the Building Department will hold in abeyance any enforcement of the zoning laws regarding the existence of the group day care homes that are currently licensed and operating in the City until this matter has been resolved by the Planning Commission and the City Council.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Mr. Waller stated for clarification that the Public Hearing in December would be a new Public Hearing because the Chair tonight officially closed the Public Hearing.

Chair Strat said the intent of the Public Hearing would be to get public input on detailed items relating to the proposed language.

Mr. Waller said publication of the Public Hearing notice should carry with it all the language that has been developed to that point by the Planning Commission in their Study Sessions.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Littman

MOTION CARRIED

Chair Strat explained the procedure that would be followed by the Planning Commission for its Study Session and Public Hearing in December. He said the proposed draft language would be prepared in advance of the December Public Hearing so the public could comment on the proposed language. Chair Strat asked that public comment be limited at the Study Session so members can focus on the proposed language.

Chair Strat opened the floor for comments and questions. He addressed specific questions and comments posed by Syed Mohiuddin of 6150 Country Ridge, Troy; Curtis and Nichol Childs of 1931 Atlas Court, Troy; and Michael Upton of 1267 Hartland, Troy.

Mr. Miller said the proposed draft language that is arrived at by a consensus of the Planning Commission would be made available to those who request it prior to the Public Hearing in December.

Mr. Schultz addressed the two Public Comment portions listed on every Planning Commission agenda.

Chair Strat requested a recess at 8:56 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 9:13 p.m.

[Messrs. Schultz and Kulesza exited the meeting.]

Resolution # PC-2005-09-153

Moved by: Waller
Seconded by: Wright

RESOLVED, That Member Schultz is excused from the balance of this meeting for personal reasons.

Yes: All present (7)
No: None
Absent: Littman, Schultz

MOTION CARRIED

8. REPORTS ON MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF PLANNING (MAP) CONFERENCE

Planning Director Miller and Members Waller, Chamberlain and Khan provided brief reports on the Michigan Association of Planning conference.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT (Items on the Agenda)

Sharon Schafer of 5593 Mandale Drive, Troy, was present. Ms. Schafer said it appears Planning Commission members and City Management have come around to understand the service provided by group day care homes. She expressed her thanks and hopes the matter goes forward in a positive way.

Curtis Childs of 1931 Atlas Court, Troy, was present. Mr. Childs distributed additional information related to group day care homes. He thanked City Management for their change to neutrality on the group day care matter.

GOOD OF THE ORDER

Mr. Savidant shared a personal story on his attendance at a previous MAP conference held at Mackinac Island.

Mr. Vleck said he is anxious to receive requested information from various governmental agencies on group day care homes. He noted it appears information can vary among governmental agencies.

Chair Strat agreed. He shared a development project he worked on with respect to different governmental agencies.

Mr. Wright addressed potential traffic hazards as a result of the height of berms, especially at Big Beaver and Long Lake Roads.

Mr. Waller suggested that Mr. Wright put his observation in writing.

Messrs. Miller and Savidant provided a brief update on the proposed PUD 5, Caswell Town Center.

Chair Strat commended the members and public for a professionally conducted meeting.

ADJOURN

The Special/Study Meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 9:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Thomas Strat, Chair

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\Planning Commission Minutes\2005 PC Minutes\Final\09-27-05 Special Study Meeting_Final.doc