

March 29, 2006

To: John M. Lamerato, Acting City Manager

From: Brian P. Murphy, Assistant City Manager/Services
Jeanette Bennett, Purchasing Director
Timothy L. Richnak, Public Works Director

Subject: **Agenda Item** – Standard Purchasing Resolution 2: Bid Award- Lowest Bidder Meeting Specifications – Asphalt Patching Material

RECOMMENDATION

On March 23, 2006, sealed bid proposals were opened to furnish one-year requirements of Asphalt Patching Material. After reviewing these proposals, City management recommends awarding a contract for Item 1, QPR- Delivered to the lowest bidder meeting specifications, Saginaw Asphalt Paving Co. of Saginaw, MI, for an estimated total cost of \$28,350.00, at unit prices contained in the attached bid tabulation. Asphalt Patching Materials are purchased on an as needed basis throughout the year based upon estimated quantities.

In addition, staff recommends rejecting Item 2, QPR/UPM picked up. Proposals submitted for the item are being rejected because the cost savings gained by awarding to the apparent low bidder, Saginaw Asphalt Paving Company at \$58.00/ton, would be offset by transportation and fuel costs traveling to their plant in Saginaw. Secondly, Barrett Paving was not considered for award of Item 2 because it is more cost effective to have material delivered at \$63.00 per ton rather than picked up at their Mt. Clemens plant for \$70.00 per ton. Therefore, in times of emergencies, material to be picked-up will be purchased on an as needed basis utilizing the informal three-quote process.

SUMMARY

Saginaw Asphalt Paving Co.

Item	Est. Qty	Description	Price Per	Est. Total
1.	450 ton	QPR – Delivered	\$63.00/ton	\$ 28,350.00
Estimated Total Cost				\$ 28,350.00

EXPLANATION OF BIDS NOT MEETING SPECIFICATIONS

The alternate bid submitted by Barrett Paving Materials Inc. for Item #1, QPR/UPM- Delivered was not awarded because the cold patch mixture, CP-6, does not meet the requirements of the current Michigan Department of State Highways Standard Specifications as listed in the bid proposal. They stated that a different liquid mixture is used and failed to provide CP-6 specifications to confirm product conformity.

The CP5 product, bid by Ajax Materials, did not meet bid specifications as listed. CP5, a lower grade cold patch, has a higher sand content, thereby reducing product workability and performance, and requiring repeated patching.

BUDGET

Funds for these materials are available through the Public Works operating budgets for Streets and Water, as monies clear through the balance sheet Inventory Account for Asphalt.

28 Vendors Notified via the MITN System

3 Bid Responses Rec'd

2 Bids did not meet specifications

2 No Bids: (1) Company does not handle the type of product specified.

(1) Company chose not to bid, but requested to remain on the bidder's list.

Prepared by: Emily Frontera, Administrative Aide

Opening Date -- 3/23/06
 Date Prepared -- 3/29/05

CITY OF TROY
 BID TABULATION
 ASPHALT PATCHING MATERIAL

VENDOR NAME:			*	
			SAGINAW	BARRETT PAVING
			ASPHALT PAVING	MATERIALS
			COMPANY	INC
ITEM #	EST QTY (TONS)	DESCRIPTION	Price/Ton	Price/Ton
1	450	QPR/UPM or Approved Alternate - Delivered Standard Train Load	\$ 63.00	\$ 70.00
			50 Tons	50 Tons
2.	100	QPR/UPM or Approved Alternate Picked up as needed	RECOMMEND REJECTION Item #2 (\$58.00) (\$70.00)	
ESTIMATED TOTAL FOR ITEM BEING AWARDED			\$ 28,350.00	N/A
HOURS OF OPERATION:			8 - 5pm	7 - 3:30pm
Notice of Delivery:			24 Hrs	24 Hrs
For Saturdays:			Blank	Call
INSURANCE: Can Meet			XX	XX
Cannot Meet				
PROXIMITY: Location--			175 & M13	Mt. Clemens
Miles--			87 Miles	Blank
TERMS:			Net 30 Days	Net 30 Days
WARRANTY:			Blank	Blank
DELIVERY: (Item 1)			1-2 days	Blank
EXCEPTIONS:			Blank	Blank
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: Y or N			Yes	Yes

DMS:

Ajax Materials Corporation - \$60.00/Ton - Reason: Alternate product - CP5, a lower grade cold patch

Barrett Paving (Alternate Bid) - \$60.00/Ton - Reason: CP6 does not meet current State Highway Standards as specified

NO BIDS

Unique Paving Materials

Carrier & Gable, Inc.

PROPOSAL - One(1) Year Requirements of Asphalt Patching Material

*** DENOTES LOWEST ACCEPTABLE BIDDER**

ATTEST:

Emily Frontera

Tom Rosewarne

Charlene McComb

Linda Bockstanz

Jeanette Bennett

Purchasing Director



Downloading History for ITB-COT 06-09 AspPatch

The report below shows all fax and e-mail vendors that matched this document when it was originally issued. It also shows all vendors that have downloaded or ordered the document and any subsequent amendments as of 3/29/2006.

Document Title:	Asphalt Patching Material
Date Issued:	3/6/2006
Close Date:	3/23/2006

Click on the table headings for "Account Number" or "Company name" to re-sort this report by that column. You may also click on any vendor account number to view their account information.

Acct #	Company Name	Service	Date Obtained Document	Date Obtained Amendments
11800	ABC PAVING COMPANY	E-mail	3/15/2006	
23787	Ace Asphalt & Paving	Free	3/22/2006	
12964	Ajax Materials Corporation	E-mail	3/8/2006	
11526	Ajax Paving Industries	E-mail	3/20/2006	
18545	AnnSeal	E-mail		
20776	Asphalt Sealcoating, Inc.	E-mail		
10139	B & J Parking Lot Maintenance, Inc.	E-mail		
12250	Barrett Paving Materials Inc.	E-mail	3/14/2006	
11631	Bowman Construction LLC	Free	3/10/2006	
10565	Cadillac Asphalt, L.L.C.	E-mail	3/9/2006	
13034	Carrier & Gable, Inc.	Fax	3/8/2006	
12164	Edw. C. Levy Co.	E-mail		
23805	Envirotech	Free	3/20/2006	
21012	Flanagan Sales & Assoc.	Free	3/13/2006	
11211	Florence Cement Company	E-mail	3/8/2006	
11514	Highway Maintenance & Construction Co.	E-mail	3/14/2006	
12217	Lafarge-QPR	E-mail		
12569	Liquid Calcium Chloride Sales	Free	3/16/2006	
17384	National Highway Maintenance System Ltd.	Free	3/10/2006	

Acct #	Company Name	Service	Date Obtained Document	Date Obtained Amendments
13691	R & E Trucking Inc.	Fax		
19789	RMC HOLDINGS	E-mail		
16696	Saginaw Asphalt Paving Co.	Free	3/6/2006	
10971	Seaboard Asphalt Products Company	E-mail	3/20/2006	
10774	SealMaster Industries	E-mail		
12535	The Stansley Group	E-mail		
14676	Unique Paving Materials	E-mail	3/6/2006	
22360	Wayne Paving & Construction, LLC	E-mail		
13436	Wolverine Contractors, Inc.	Fax		