

May 26, 2006

To: John M. Lamerato, Acting City Manager

From: Brian P. Murphy, Assistant City Manager/Services  
Jeanette Bennett, Purchasing Director  
Carol Anderson, Parks and Recreation Director

Subject: **Agenda Item:** Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: - Best Value Award  
Infestation Control Services – Landscaping

---

### **RECOMMENDATION**

On May 12, 2006, request for proposals were opened for three (3) year requirements of Infestation Control Services with an option to renew for three (3) additional one-year periods. City management recommends awarding the three-year contract to Owen Tree Service, Inc., of Attica, MI, the best value proposal as a result of a RFP process at unit prices contained in the attached bid tabulation and chemical listing dated 5/24/06.

The award is contingent upon contractor's submission of properly executed proposal and contract documents, including the insurance and all other specified requirements.

### **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

In accordance with the City's Integrated Pest Management (IPM) program, whenever an insect exceeds the threshold population (i.e. that population density that is considered unacceptable by the City) preventative measures need be taken to reduce the population to or below threshold levels.

Due to the past warm winters, the following insects have established populations that exceed the threshold levels on the Honeylocust (*Gleditsia triacanthos inermis*). These insects include:

- Mimosa Webworm – *Homadaula anisocentra*
- Calico Scale – *Eulecanium cerasorum*
- Lecanium Scale – *Lecanium* spp.

Defoliation of the honeylocust, large number of caterpillars and the formation of honeydew on hard surfaces generated numerous calls from residents in City sections # 17, 18, 19, and 20 last year. Most recently calls have been received from residents in City sections # 12 and 14.

### **SELECTION PROCESS**

The Request for Proposal to control the above listed insects and for emerald ash borer and gypsy moth were sent out. Interested parties submitted costs for control of these insects by tree injection and ground spraying.

May 26, 2006

To: John M. Lamerato, Acting City Manager  
Re: Bid Award – Infestation Control Services – Landscaping

**SELECTION PROCESS** - continued

Proposals were received from four (4) companies. The four (4) proposals were rated on a pass / fail criteria. Of the four (4) submittals, two (2) met the pass / fail criteria. The two (2) successful companies were then compared based on cost and references. Owen Tree Services had the lowest costs in the MATERIALS & LABOR section. Mike's Tree Surgeons, Inc. had the lowest costs in the SERVICE FEE PROPOSAL section. As the service fees were intended for informational purposes only, the recommendation will go to Owen Tree Services. Their references included other municipal experience as well as being a previous contractor with the City of Troy.

**BUDGET**

Funds are available in Park and Recreation Capital Account for Subdivision Improvements # 401780.7974.130.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY INFESTATION CONTROL SERVICES

### STATISTICS:

- ◆ **Forty-two (42) Proposal notices were sent to prospective bidders**
- ◆ **Sixty-seven (67) Vendors notified on the MITN System**
- ◆ **Four (4) firms responded to the proposal**
- ◆ **Two (2) firms met the pass / fail criteria**
- ◆ **Owen's Tree Service is the recommended contractor as a result of a best value process**

### Selection Process:

1. **Firms were evaluated on Pass / Fail Criteria**
2. **Lowest bidder who passes Phase 1 will be recommended for award**

VENDOR NAME:

	*	<b>Owen's Tree Services</b>	<b>Mike's Tree Service</b>

**PROPOSAL: PROVIDE INFESTATION CONTROL SERVICES FOR THE PARKS & RECREATION DEPARTMENT FOR THE 2006 THROUGH 2009 TREE/ACREAGE**

VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE: Y or N	Yes	Yes	
<b>EST QTY SERVICE (Material &amp; Labor)</b>	<b>Unit Price</b>	<b>Unit Price</b>	
1,000 Trees Municipal Tree Injection	\$ 8.00	\$ 43.75	
1,000 Trees Municipal Tree Spraying	\$ 20.00	\$ 21.25	
50 Acres Municipal Tree Spraying	\$ 260.00	\$ 295.00	
<b>ESTIMATED GRAND TOTAL:</b>	* \$ 41,000.00	\$ 79,750.00	

<b>PROPOSAL: SERVICE</b>	<b>HOURLY RATE</b>	<b>HOURLY RATE</b>	
Certified Arborist	\$ 65.00	\$ 50.00	
Certified Pesticide Applicator	\$ 130.00	\$ 50.00	
Mileage Charge (If any)	Blank	N/A	
Foreman	\$ 65.00	\$ 45.00	
Office Administrator	Blank	\$ 35.00	
Ground Crew	\$ 65.00	\$ 30.00	
<b>Additional Required Services:</b>	Blank	Blank	
<b>Optional / Services etc:</b>	Blank	Blank	
<b>Equipment Rates:</b>	Blank	Flatbed Truck \$ 45.00	
<b>OVERTIME RATES:</b>	N/A	1.5	
<b>SUNDAY RATES:</b>	N/A	2	
<b>HOLIDAY RATES:</b>	N/A	3	
<b>DISCOUNT</b>	Blank	0%	
<b>CHEMICAL PRICE LIST DATED</b> Y or N	Has been provided +>	Blank	Attachment H
<b>SITE VISIT:</b> Y or N DATED	Yes	Yes	
	5/10/2006	3/23/2006	
<b>INSURANCE</b> Can meet	XX	XX	
Cannot meet			
1. Mandatory Req.      Circled A or B	(B) Blank	A	
2. Non-Mandatory Requirement	Blank	Blank	
<b>TERMS:</b>	Blank	Net 30	
<b>WARRANTY:</b>	Blank	Blank	
<b>DELIVERY DATES:</b>	Blank	5/12/2006	
<b>EXCEPTIONS:</b>	Blank	See Attachment "G"	
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:</b> Y or N	Yes	No	

\* DENOTES BEST VALUE PROPOSAL

**DMS:**  
Charles F Irish Co. \$42,100.00 Reason: Incomplete bid - no detailed equipment list, no experience with primary target insect mimosa webworm, limited pool of qualified employees  
Clark's Pest Control \$116,730.00 Reason: Incomplete bid - no detailed equipment list, limited pool of qualified employees

**ATTEST:**  
Mark Columbo  
Cheryl Stewart  
Linda Bockstanz

**NO BIDS:**  
JH Hart Urban Forestry  
Rose Pest Solution

Jeanette Bennett  
Purchasing Director