

June 28, 2006

TO: John M Lamerato, Acting City Manager

FROM: Jeanette Bennett, Purchasing Director  
Cindy Stewart, Community Affairs Director

SUBJECT: **Agenda Item:** Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value  
Process Award – 2007 Calendar/Annual Report Printing Services

### **RECOMMENDATION**

On May 17, 2006, five (5) proposals were opened to provide Printing & Design Services to mail 40,000 copies of the 2007 City of Troy Calendar/Annual Report with the option to renew for the 2008 calendar year. City management recommends that a contract be awarded to **University Lithoprinters** of Ann Arbor, MI, the bidder providing the best value with the highest final weighted score of 87.92, which included calendar samples and a price scoring evaluation process, at an estimated cost of \$33,825.00 per year at unit prices contained in the attached bid tabulation, plus \$2,310.00 for the reply card insert.

Although University Lithoprinters is not the lowest total bidder, price is just one component in the “Best Value” approach to a Request for Proposal process. The award recommendation was based upon the vendor offering the best combination of a variety of factors; not simply the lowest bidder meeting certain minimal requirements. A best value approach addresses ability, experience, and quality issues leading to a successful contract and reduction in risk of poor service for such high profile PR tools as the City Calendar/Annual Report.

### **BACKGROUND**

On September 22, 2003, University Lithoprinters was awarded the contract to provide the 2004 City Calendar/Annual Report. An option to renew printing services for the 2005 and 2006 Calendar/Annual Report was exercised. Cost for the 2006 calendar was \$38,650.00. This included 40,000 calendars plus minor corrections to proof throughout the process.

The calendar size is 8½ x11 (a cost savings measure instituted in 2004) and has a reply card as an option. The estimate for the 2007 calendar would be \$33,825.00 or \$36,135.00 with the reply card.

We have also sold advertising in the 2005 and 2006 City Calendars to help offset printing costs. The total amount collected in 2006 was \$11,335.00 for the advertising insert. We intend to sell advertising again for the 2007 calendar to help offset costs and anticipate collecting a comparable amount.

June 28, 2006

To: John M Lamerato, Acting City Manager

Re: Award Recommendation - Printing Services – City Calendar

Page 2 of 2

## **SUMMARY**

After completing the evaluation process, University Lithographers received the highest recommendations from the committee. In an effort to achieve the most positive image for our City Calendar and personnel working in the field, and supply the best service, proper quality at the right price; a best value approach was used to evaluate and award the contract.

University Lithographers received the highest recommendations from the committee consisting of the Community Affairs Director, Community Affairs Officer and Finance Department Account Clerk. They received superior marks based on their quality samples. University Lithographers has serviced many other municipalities on similar projects of comparable magnitude. City calendars they produced within the last five years include Troy, Westland, Dearborn, Warren, and Novi. Not only did this company furnish the most impressive and complete proposal package; they as well as their designer received outstanding endorsements from the Cities of Novi, Dearborn, Warren and Westland when we called them inquiring about their calendar printer. University Lithographers also produced calendars for The Masarati Club, Consumers Energy, University of Michigan and the Detroit Free Press. The Community Affairs Department staff has worked with University Lithographers and Graphic Visions on a number of projects and is very impressed with their professionalism, creativity, cooperation and timeliness. University Lithographers has their own bindery and does the mail prep in house.

## **BUDGET**

Funds are available from the operating budget in the Community Affairs Department a/c# 748.7901.

120 Vendors notified via the MITN System

122 Notices distributed by mail and email to prospective bidders

1 Vendor Walked-In

5 Proposals Received

Opening Date -- 5/17/06  
Date Prepared -- 5/22/06

CITY OF TROY  
TABULATION  
PRINTING 2007 CALENDAR/ANNUAL REPORT

RFP-COT 06-16  
Pg 1 of 2

FIRM NAME:

Dearborn Lithograph, Inc.	TGI Direct	University Lithoprinters Inc.
101178360	35644763	111781
<b>\$1,500.00</b>	<b>\$1,500.00</b>	<b>\$1,500.00</b>

Check Number  
Amount

**PROPOSAL: Furnish and deliver to a designated mailing service 40,000 copies of the City of Troy Year 2007 Calendar / Annual Report, including graphic design services, presswork, packaging, delivery, etc.....**

VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE: (Yes or No)	Yes	Yes	Yes
SAMPLE CALENDAR: (Yes or No)	Yes	Yes	Yes
SAMPLE PAPER: (Yes or No)	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>STOCK</b>	<b>Option A</b>	Complete for the Sum of:	
		\$ 29,044.00	\$ 32,599.00
		\$ 592.50	\$ 815.00
			\$ 550.00
			Troy calendar
<b>ALTERNATE</b>	<b>Option B</b>	Omni Gloss	Euro Art 80# Gloss
		Omni Silk	Euro Art 70# Dull
		M-Real	Millcraft
		\$ 26,802.00	\$ 30,982.00
		\$ 534.80	\$ 775.00
			\$ 535.00
			Novi calendar
			80 lb Creator Gloss
			80 lb Creator Silk
			Torraspapel USA, Inc.
<b>OPTIONAL:</b>	<b>Option A</b>	Complete for the Sum of:	
<b>Reply Card</b>		\$ 1,981.92	\$ 2,398.00
		\$ 42.98	\$ 59.95
			\$ 20.00
<b>ALTERNATE</b>	<b>Option B</b>	Omni Matte	75# White, uncoated
		Blank	N/A
		M-Real	Wausau
		\$ 1,711.00	\$ 1,397.00
		\$ 36.28	\$ 34.92
			Blank
<b>ADDITIONAL COSTS:</b>	SCANS:	Cost for each color photo over 65 color scans	\$25.00 /scan
			\$0.00 /scan
			\$45.00 /scan
EDIT CHARGES:	Hourly rate for edits	\$ 55.00	\$ 75.00
			\$ 85.00
DELIVERY DATE	Can meet schedule	XX	XX
	Cannot meet but offers		XX
TERMS:		Net 30 Days	Net 30 Days
			Net 30 Days
DELIVERY DATE:		12/11/2006	5/17/2006
			12/11/2006
EXCEPTIONS:		Blank	N/A
			Any paper cost increases will be documented & presented to the City
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:	Y or N	Yes	Yes
			Yes
ADDENDUM #1	Y or N	Yes	Yes
			Yes

ATTEST:

Laura Campbell  
Susan M. Davis  
Linda Bockstanz

Jeanette Bennett  
Purchasing Director

FIRM NAME:		* <b>University Lithoprinters</b>	Grand River Printing	Brophy
		<b>Option C</b>		
	Check Number	111781	453266	567005098
	Amount	<b>\$1,500.00</b>	<b>\$1,500.00</b>	<b>\$1,500.00</b>
<b>PROPOSAL: Furnish and deliver to a designated mailing service 40,000 copies of the City of Troy Year 2007 Calendar / Annual Report, including graphic design services, presswork, packaging, delivery, etc.....</b>				
VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE: (Yes or No)		Yes	Yes	Yes
SAMPLE CALENDAR:	(Yes or No)	Yes	Yes	No
SAMPLE PAPER:	(Yes or No)	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>STOCK</b>	<b>Option A</b> Complete for the Sum of: Cost per Additional (M) : Per Specifications	n/a	Blank	\$ 64,200.00
		n/a	Blank	\$ 578.00
			Paper Not Available in Web	
ALTERNATE	<b>Option B</b> Quoting On Cover Stock Quoting on Text Stock Manufactured by: Complete for the Sum of: Cost per Additional (M) :	Dearborn calendar <b>Commerce Gloss 80#</b> <b>Commerce Dull 80#</b> <b>SAPPI</b>	80# #2 Gloss 70# #2 Gloss Productolith	Commerce Gloss 80# Commerce Dull 80# Sappi
		<b>\$ 33,825.00</b>	\$ 34,617.08	\$ 62,661.00
		<b>\$ 535.00</b>	\$ 865.00	\$ 595.00
<b>OPTIONAL:</b>				
<b>Reply Card</b>	<b>Option A</b> Complete for the Sum of: Cost per Additional (M) : Per Specifications	<b>\$ 2,310.00</b>	\$ 2,767.00	\$ 2,345.00
		<b>\$ 20.00</b>	\$ 69.00	\$ 43.00
ALTERNATE	<b>Option B</b> Quoting On Cover Stock Quoting on Text Stock Manufactured by:	Blank	N/A	Per Xpedx - No comparable
		Blank	N/A	alternate stock at this price
		Blank	N/A	level
<b>ADDITIONAL COSTS:</b>				
SCANS: Cost for each color photo over 65 color scans		<b>\$45.00</b> /scan	\$25.00 /scan	\$55.00 /scan
EDIT CHARGES:	Hourly rate for edits	<b>\$ 85.00</b>	\$ 80.00	\$ 75.00
DELIVERY DATE	Can meet schedule	XX	XX	XX
	<u>Dec 11th</u> Cannot meet but offers			
TERMS:		Net 30 Days	Net 30	60 Days
DELIVERY DATE:		12/11/2006	12/11/2006	5/17/2006
EXCEPTIONS:		Any paper cost increases will be documented & presented to the City	Blank	Samples: have not been involved in printing of a calendar within the past few years.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:	Y or N	Yes	Yes	Yes
ADDENDUM #1	Y or N	Yes	Yes	Yes

NO BIDS:  
Caldwell Printing

\* DENOTES BEST VALUE PROPOSAL



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY PRINTING 2007 CALENDAR

### STATISTICS:

- ◆ 120 Vendors notified via the MITN System
- ◆ 122 Notices were distributed by mail and e-mail to prospective bidders
- ◆ 1 Vendor Walked-In
- ◆ 5 proposals were received
- ◆ University Lithoprinters was the most qualified bidder by receiving the highest weighted score

**The following bidders submitted a proposal and received the indicated final scores:**

COMPANY	SCORE
University Lithoprinters	87.92 **
Dearborn Lithograph	82.4
Grand River Printing	69.92
TGI Direct	69.36
Brophy	28.88

Attachments:

Weighted Final Scoring Including "Sample" and Price Scoring  
Evaluation Process

## WEIGHTED FINAL SCORING PRINTING 2007 CALENDAR

### Final Score Calculation:

$$\begin{aligned}
 &40\% \times \text{Price Score} \\
 &60\% \times \text{Sample Score} - \text{Weighted Average} \\
 &100\% \quad \text{Final Weighted Score}
 \end{aligned}$$

\* In order to equate the price to the weighted evaluation process scoring, the prices had to be converted into a score with the base of 100

### SAMPLE SCORE (60%)

Raters:	1	2	3	AVERAGE
<b>Vendors:</b>				
Dearborn Lithograph	60	63	89	70.67
Brophy	67	71	74	70.67
TGI Direct	58	66	54	59.33
Grand River Printing	73	39	96	69.33
University Lithoprinters	98	96	98	97.33

### PRICING SCORES (40%) – Option B

<b>Vendors:</b>	FORMULA: $[1 - (\text{Proposal price} - \text{low price}) / \text{low price}] \times \text{available points}$		
Dearborn Lithograph	$[1 - (26802 - 26802) / 26802] * 100$		100
Brophy	$[1 - (62661 - 26802) / 26802] * 100$		-33.8
TGI Direct	$[1 - (30982 - 26802) / 26802] * 100$		84.4
Grand River Printing	$[1 - (34617.08 - 26802) / 26802] * 100$		70.8
University Lithoprinters	$[1 - (33825 - 26802) / 26802] * 100$		73.8

### FINAL WEIGHTED SCORE:

VENDORS:	University ** Lithoprinters	Dearborn	Grand River Printing	TGI Direct	Brophy
Score					
PRICE SCORE: (x .40) =	29.52	40	28.32	33.76	-13.52
SAMPLE SCORE: (x .60) =	58.40	42.40	41.60	35.60	42.4
Final Score:	87.92	82.4	69.92	69.36	28.88

\*\* HIGHEST RATED VENDOR – RECOMMENDED AWARD



## SELECTION PROCESS

### CRITERIA FOR SELECTION

The identified City Committee will review the proposals. The City of Troy reserves the right to award this proposal to the company considered the most qualified based upon a combination of factors including but not limited to the following:

- A. Compliance with qualifications criteria
- B. Completeness of the proposal
- C. Financial strength and capacity of the printer
- D. Correlation of the proposals submitted to the needs of the City of Troy
- E. Any other factors which may be deemed to be in the City's best interest
- F. Evaluation Process

#### Phase 1: Qualifications Evaluation.

Bidders will be required to meet minimum established criteria in order to go to the second phase of the process.

#### Phase 2: Sample Evaluation Process.

- o The City Committee will use a weighted scoring sheet to evaluate the required submitted samples.
- o Each Committee Member will calculate a weighted score.
- o The scores of the three Committee Members will be averaged into one score for each bidder for this phase of the process.

#### Phase 3: Price

Points for price will be calculated as follows:

#### **FORMULA:**

$$[1 - (\text{Proposal price} - \text{low price}) / \text{low price}] \times \text{available points}$$

#### Phase 4: Final Scoring and Selection

The highest final weighted scored will be the printer recommended to the Troy City Council for Award.

$$\begin{array}{r} 40\% \times \text{Price Score (100 pt. Base)} \\ 60\% \times \text{Sample Calendar Score (100 pt. Base)} \\ \hline 100\% \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{r} = \\ = \\ \text{Final Weighted Score} \end{array}$$

Note: The City of Troy reserves the right to change the order or eliminate an evaluation phase if deemed in the City's best interest to do so.