



CITY COUNCIL ACTION REPORT

April 5, 2007

TO: Phillip L. Nelson, City Manager

FROM: Susan A. Leirstein, Purchasing Director
Cindy Stewart, Community Affairs Director

SUBJECT: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award – Printing of Troy Today, Quarterly Newsletter

Background

- On March 26, 2007, Requests for Proposals (RFP) were received and opened to provide printing services for the Troy Today, our quarterly newsletter.
- 135 vendors were notified via the MITN system with three (3) bidders responding and one (1) statement of no bid received.
- Color Q had to withdraw from the process due to a their error, which assumed the size of the newsletter was 5x8 instead of 8 ¼ x 10 5/8.

Financial Considerations

- Funds are available in the Community Affairs account # 748.7901, Library account #790.7901 and Parks & Recreation account # 752.7901.

Legal Considerations

- RFP-COT 07-07 for Printing of the *Troy Today* was competitively bid and opened with three bidders responding.
- All bidders were given the opportunity to respond with their level of interest in printing a quarterly newsletter for the City of Troy.

Policy Considerations

- *Troy Today*, an all-encompassing quarterly newsletter to inform residents and businesses about pertinent City news, Library, Museum and Parks & Recreation programs and special events, is mailed to all residential and business addresses. (Goal IV)
- *Troy Today* also incorporates standard resource information like contact names and phone numbers for City Departments, City Council, and other community organizations. It maintains regular features including road and infrastructure construction maps, business development news, City Council meeting schedules, Police and Fire safety tips and special programs, and other helpful information. (Goal II & Goal IV)

Options

- City Management and the Community Affairs department recommend awarding a one-year contract with two one (1) year renewal options for printing services for the *Troy Today* to the highest scoring respondent as a result of a best value process, Grand River Printing and Imaging, of Belleville, MI for an estimated one year total cost of \$80,342.80 at prices contained in the RFP tabulation, plus the actual cost of bulk rate postage.



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Printing of Troy Today

STATISTICS:

- ◆ **One-Hundred Thirty-Five (135) Firms notified via the MITN e-procurement website**
- ◆ **Three (3) proposals were received**
- ◆ **Grand River Printing was the most qualified vendor by receiving the highest weighted score**

The following bidders submitted a proposal and received the indicated final scores:

Firm	SCORE
Grand River Printing	69
University Lithoprinters	61

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS - FIRMS ELMINATED FROM FURTHER CONSIDERATION (BID WITHDRAWN BY VENDOR)

- Color Q

Attachments:

- ✓ Weighted Final Scoring Including Qualification Statement and Newsletter Sample Scoring
- ✓ Evaluation Process



WEIGHTED FINAL SCORING
Printing of Troy Today

Final Score Calculation:

40% x Sample Evaluation Process
40% x Price Score
~~20% x Interview Score~~ Deleted Phase

100% = Final Weighted Score

In order to equate the price to the weighted evaluation process scoring, the prices had to be converted into a score with the base of 100. **NOTE:** Vendors are listed in order of bid opening.

Weighted Average Score for Sample Evaluation: 40%

RATERS	1	2	3	AVERAGE
Vendors:				
University Lithoprinters	97	99	97	98
Grand River Printing	63	78	77	73

Weighted Average Score for Price: 40%

RATERS	Weighted Criteria - Difference in Costs (1-(Proposal price - lowest price)/low price) x available points
Vendors:	
University Lithoprinters	$(1-(117,460.00-80,342.80)/80,342.80) \times 100 = 54$
Grand River Printing	$(1-(80,342.80-80,342.80)/80,342.80) \times 100 = 100$

FINAL WEIGHTED SCORE:

VENDORS:	University Lithoprinters	**Grand River Printing
Score		
Sample Evaluation Score: (x .40) =	98 x .40 = 39	73 x .40 = 29
Price Score: (x .40) =	54 x .40 = 22	100 x .40 = 40
Final Score:	61	69

** HIGHEST RATED VENDOR - RECOMMENDED AWARD



SELECTION PROCESS

CRITERIA FOR SELECTION

The identified City Committee will review the proposals. The City of Troy reserves the right to award this proposal to the printer considered the most qualified based upon a combination of factors including but not limited to the following:

- A. Compliance with qualifications criteria
- B. Completeness of the proposal
- C. Financial strength and capacity of the printer
- D. Correlation of the proposals submitted to the needs of the City of Troy
- E. Any other factors which may be deemed to be in the City's best interest
- F. Evaluation Process

Phase 1: Qualifications Evaluation.

Bidders will be required to meet minimum established criteria in order to go to the second phase of the process.

Phase 2: Sample Evaluation Process.

The City Committee will use a weighted score sheet to independently evaluate the samples of the "City" type newsletters and paper stock submitted as required. Each Committee Member will calculate a weighted score. The scores of the Committee Members will be averaged into one score for each bidder for this phase of the process.

Phase 3: Interview (Optional).

The City Committee will use a weighted score sheet to independently rate the interview. Each committee member will calculate a weighted score. The scores will be averaged into one score for each bidder for this phase of the process.

Phase 4: Price

Points for price will be calculated as follows:

FORMULA - { 1 - (Proposal Price - Low Price) / low price } x available points

Final Scoring and Printer Selection.

40% x Weighted Average Score – Sample Evaluation Process
20% x Interview Score
+ ~~20%~~ x Price Score 40%
= Final Weighted Score

The highest final weighted scored printer will be the printer recommended to the Troy City Council for Award.

Note: The City of Troy reserves the right to change the order or eliminate an evaluation phase if deemed in the City's best interest to do so.

Opening Date -- 3-26-07
 Date Prepared -- 4/5/07

CITY OF TROY
 BID TABULATION
 PRINTING OF TROY TODAY

VENDOR NAME:

Grand River Printing and Imaging	University Lithographers
12949	114845
\$500.00/\$1500.00 on File	\$2,000.00

CHECK #

CHECK AMOUNT

PROPOSAL: FURNISH ALL LABOR, MATERIALS, AND EQUIPMENT TO PROVIDE ONE YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF OFFSET PRINTING AND DELIVERY OF TROY TODAY WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR PERIODS

QTY	DESCRIPTION		
Vendor Questionnaire	Filled out Y or N	Yes	Yes
40,000 Copies per Printing	Printing of TROY TODAY Four Times per Year (160,000 Copies per Year)		
	Complete for the Sum of:	\$ 20,085.70	\$ 29,365.00
	Extended Yearly Cost:	\$ 80,342.80	\$ 117,460.00
Paper Manufactured by:	Cover Inside	Orion	Mead West Vaco
		Windsor	Domtar
Additional Charges:			
1) Cost per each additional 4-page spread			
60 lb White Offset Paper		\$ 1,422.40	1st) \$147.00 2nd) \$2,478
60 lb Gloss Cover Stock		\$ 1,131.17	N/A
Add'l Scans		\$ 15.00	
2) Changes once the Dylux or Sherpa is produced		\$95.00/Hour	\$65.00/Hour
3) Cost for additional quantities per 500 Copies:			
	Offset Gloss Text		
Base Bid (80 Pages + 4 pages)		\$ 193.36	76 pgs + 4 pgs \$308.00
<i>Optional Pricing</i>			
a.) 88 Pages (84 Pages + 4 pages)		\$ 207.80	80 pgs + 4 pgs \$315.00
b.) 88 Pages (80 Pages + 8 pages)		\$ 206.15	84 pgs + 4 pgs \$345.00
c.) 92 Pages (84 Pages + 8 pages)		\$ 214.31	N/A
Completion Schedule:			
Can meet 10 BUSINESS DAYS		XX	XX
Cannot meet			
Contact Information			
Hours of Operations		24 Hours / 7 Days per week	Mon - Sat 24 Hours
24 Hrs Phone No.		734-394-1400	734-973-9414
Terms		2% 10 Days, Net 30	Net 30
Delivery		10 BUSINESS DAYS	
Samples Y or N		Yes	Yes
Exceptions:		Blank	None
Acknowledgement Completed Y or N		Yes	Yes

NO BIDS:
 Dearborn Lithograph, Inc

BOLDFACE TYPE DENOTES BEST VALUE PROPOSAL

BIDS WITHDRAWN BY VENDOR:
 Color Q

ATTEST:
 Laura Campbell
 Ellen Hodorek
 Julie Hamilton

 Susan Leirstein CPPB
 Purchasing Director