Chair Tagle called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on August 14, 2012 in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:
Donald Edmunds
Michael W. Hutson
Edward Kempen
Tom Krent
Philip Sanzica
John J. Tagle

Absent:
Gordon Schepke
Robert Schultz
Thomas Strat

Also Present:
R. Brent Savidant, Planning Director
Susan Lancaster, Assistant City Attorney
Ben Carlisle, Carlisle/Wortman Associates, Inc.
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Resolution # PC-2012-08-053
Moved by: Edmunds
Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as printed.
Yes: All present (6)
Absent: Schepke, Schultz, Strat

MOTION CARRIED

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Resolution # PC-2012-08-054
Moved by: Krent
Seconded by: Kempen

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of the July 24, 2012 Special/Study meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (6)
Absent: Schepke, Schultz, Strat

MOTION CARRIED

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Items not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEWS

5. PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP 975) – Proposed Sears Holdings Technical Center, North of Big Beaver, West of Coolidge (2240 Cunningham), Section 19, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District (Consent Judgment)

Mr. Carlisle reviewed and expressed support of the proposed application. Mr. Carlisle recommended that the Planning Commission recommend approval of the proposed fence, with the conditions as listed in his report dated July 27, 2012.

John Premo of Kickham Hanley, 32121 Woodward Avenue, Royal Oak, was present to represent the petitioner. Mr. Premo displayed several colored renderings of the proposed project. He addressed the hours the gates would be open and closed. Mr. Premo indicated they propose to re-curb and create a small island along the eastern parking lot to provide protection for the fence.

The petitioner, Michael Dybowski, Divisional Vice President of Sears Holdings Management Corporation, was present. Mr. Dybowski addressed the need for a fence to enhance their security system for the protection of their data, the facility and their associates. He expressed willingness to comply with any City regulations and wishes to assure the facility is aesthetically correct and appealing.

Resolution # PC-2012-08-055
Moved by: Edmunds
Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby recommends to City Council that Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the revised site plan for the Sears Holdings Technical Center, including a proposed eight-foot high security fence, a portion of which is located in the front yard, located north of Big Beaver, west of Coolidge (2240 Cunningham), in Section 19, currently zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, but controlled by Consent Judgment be granted, subject to the following:

1. Satisfy the Fire Department's access requirements including providing gate code or opener;
2. Replace any trees removed as a result of fence installation; and
3. Indicate what protection within their parking lot is being provided by the fence.

Yes: All present (6)
Absent: Schepke, Schultz, Strat

MOTION CARRIED

6. PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP 976) – Proposed Regents Park of Troy Phase II, West of Crooks, North side of Butterfield, Section 29, Currently Zoned MF (Multi Family) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the proposed project and reported that it meets all requirements. Mr. Carlisle recommended approval of the Preliminary Site Plan application contingent on the applicant satisfying the requirements as listed in his report, dated August 10, 2012, prior to Final Site Plan approval.

The petitioner, Jennifer Roth of Village Green, 30833 Northwestern Highway, Farmington Hills, was present. Ms. Green gave an overview of Phase I of the Regents Park of Troy, displayed several renderings of the proposed Phase II and addressed the intent to create one cohesive design with the integration of Phase II.

Ms. Roth addressed the contingencies listed in the Planning Consultant report, as follows:

1. Provide minimum floor area per unit information – ***Will comply***
2. Add one additional tree along Butterfield Road – ***Will comply***
3. Obtain variance from the Building Board of Appeals to allow for a 6-foot high fence where only 30 inches are allowed – ***Noted appeal would be to allow a 4-foot high fence***
4. Provide trash enclosure details – ***Requested to utilize same trash removal process currently used for Phase I (rotation of dumpsters through week, place trash at curbside on pickup day)***
5. Fixture details and photometrics that comply with Section 13.05 – ***Will comply***
6. Provide at least two bicycle spaces – ***Requested approval to place bicycle spaces inside each building garage; further noted that clubhouse has two bicycle racks available***

Discussion followed on:

- Fence requirement at the time of Phase I.
- Stormwater management.
- Bicycle spaces; required location, access by guests and residents.
- Dumpsters/trash removal process currently in place; length of time trash at curbside.
- Building Board of Appeals approval process in relation to site plan approval.

Resolution # PC-2012-08-056
Moved by: Sanzica
Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Regents Park of Troy Phase II, located west of Crooks on the north side of Butterfield, Section 29, within the MF (Multi-Family Residential) district, be granted, subject to the following:

1. Provide minimum floor area per unit information.
2. Add one additional tree along Butterfield Road.
3. Obtain variance from the Building Code Board of Appeals to allow for a 4-foot high fence where only 30 inches are allowed in the front yard.
4. Submit fixture and pole details and revised photometrics that comply with Section 13.05 as part of final site plan review.
5. Provide at least two bicycle spaces within building structures.

Yes: All present (6)
Absent: Schepke, Schultz, Strat

MOTION CARRIED

PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT

7. PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT (File Number PUD 004) – Big Beaver Center (formerly "The Monarch") PUD, North side of Big Beaver Road between Alpine and McClure, Section 20, Currently Zoned PUD 004 and R-1B (One Family Residential) Districts

Mr. Carlisle reviewed how the applicant addressed commercial and residential site plan issues since the last review. He addressed traffic issues and the City's traffic consultant's report prepared by Stephen Dearing of Orchard, Hiltz & McCliment (OHM). Mr. Carlisle reported the applicant addressed all outstanding issues with the exception of providing the required 20% site landscaping. Mr. Carlisle expressed support for the proposed project and recommended approval.

There was discussion on:
- PUD zoning with respect to future commercial uses.
- PUD development agreement.
- Landscaping requirement/deficiency in relation to urban style development.

Mr. Krent addressed concerns with the proposed access drives, curb cuts and potential traffic problems on Alpine.

The petitioner, Arkan Jonna of AF Jonna Development, 4036 Telegraph, Bloomfield Hills, was present and addressed the following:
- Underlying zoning; need for flexibility in re-leasing spaces in future.
- Hardscaping and landscaping.
- Traffic.
- Materials and building samples (on display).
- Parking in relation to restaurant usage.

Resolution # PC-2012-08-057
Moved by: Krent
Seconded by: Sanzica

WHEREAS, AF Jonna Development submitted an application for a Planned Unit Development, including a 24,000 square foot retail building and a 3,500 square foot bank branch along Big Beaver Road, with 16 single family residential units to the north; and,

WHEREAS, The application is consistent with the City of Troy Master Plan; and,

WHEREAS, The commercial component along Big Beaver achieves many of the goals of the Big Beaver Corridor Study; and,

WHEREAS, The pedestrian amenities proposed by the applicant along Big Beaver provide a significant public benefit by offering a pedestrian style and scale building that can be an example to be emulated along the Big Beaver corridor; and

WHEREAS, The residential component serves as a suitable transition between the commercial component and the existing residential neighborhood to the north; and,

WHEREAS, The application is compatible with adjacent properties and uses.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby recommends that City Council approve of the rezoning of the northern two parcels (3128 Alpine and 3141 McClure) from R-1B One Family Residential District to PUD Planned Unit Development, and that these two parcels be included in the proposed PUD; and,

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby recommends that City Council concurrently approve the Concept Development Plan (CDP) and Preliminary Development Plan (PDP) approval for the Big Beaver Center PUD.

Yes: Edmunds, Hutson, Kempen, Sanzica, Tagle
No: Krent
Absent: Schepke, Schultz, Strat

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Krent requested to place a substitute motion on the floor. Ms. Lancaster advised that only a member of the majority vote could place a substitute motion on the floor.

Mr. Krent stated his proposed substitute motion would incorporate the following provisions and read as follows:

> ***THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED***, The bank branch is to be located on the east end of the Big Beaver Road property frontage for the following reasons. Its proposed location at the west end of the Big Beaver Road frontage imposes a detrimental traffic impact to the residents north of the project. Additionally, the proposed west location creates a potential traffic hazard between vehicles entering Alpine Road from Big Beaver Road and vehicles exiting the bank drive-through lanes because of the bank's exit lanes' close proximity to Big Beaver Road.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, The access to the retail parking lot from Alpine Road and the access to Alpine Road from the retail parking lot shall be limited to one curb cut which shall be located at the northernmost end of the retail parking lot to reduce traffic congestion on Alpine Road at the Big Beaver Road intersection. This one curb cut will be a directional driveway that is curved toward Big Beaver Road making it difficult to turn north onto Alpine.

Ms. Lancaster said it appears that flipping or moving the building is a change to the design and advised that it is the discretion of the Board whether the proposed substitute motion is a re-design of the proposed site plan. She said the substitute motion, as proposed, should be open for discussion and is at the discretion of the Board whether the motion should be entertained.

Mr. Sanzica said he recognizes and sympathizes with the concerns expressed by Mr. Krent and respects his interest in the proposed application. Mr. Sanzica said he could not support the substitute motion as proposed because the City's traffic consultant's opinion is in support of the design.

Chair Tagle asked if any member of the Board would support entertaining the substitute motion as proposed by Mr. Krent.

There was no response; therefore, no motion on the table.

The minutes hereby reflect the concerns and reasons for the dissenting vote by Mr. Krent on Resolution # PC-2012-08-057.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Items on Current Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

9. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENTS

There was general Planning Commission discussion.

Mr. Savidant reported on the Sustainable Development Committee.

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 8:36 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

John J. Tagle, Chair

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\Planning Commission Minutes\2012 PC Minutes\Final\2012 08 14 Regular Meeting_Final.doc