A regular meeting of the Troy Traffic Committee was held Wednesday, October 21, 2015 in the Lower Level Conference Room at Troy City Hall. Pete Ziegenfelder called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call

Present: Tim Brandstetter
Mitch Huber
Al Petrulis
Pete Ziegenfelder

Absent: David Easterbrook
Richard Kilmer
Cynthia Wilsher
Katie Regan (Student Representative)

Also present: Allen Ferguson, 6737 Michael Drive
Jennifer Walters, 84 Melanie Lane
Roch Morin, 6725 Michael Drive
Kevin Nunning, 79 Melanie Lane
Justin John, 6756 Michael Drive
Lt. Eric Caloia, Fire Department
Sgt. Mike Szuminski, Police Department
Bill Huotari, Deputy City Engineer/Traffic Engineer

2. Minutes – September 16, 2015

Resolution # 2015-10-44
Moved by Petrulis
Seconded by Brandstetter

To approve the September 16, 2015 minutes as printed.

Yes: Brandstetter, Huber, Petrulis, Ziegenfelder
No: None
Absent: Easterbrook, Kilmer, Wilsher

MOTION CARRIED

REGULAR BUSINESS

3. Reconsideration – Request for Traffic Control – Melanie Lane at Michael Drive

The Traffic Committee recommended that a Stop sign be installed on the southbound Michael Drive approach to Melanie Lane at the September 16, 2015 meeting. This recommendation was brought back to the Traffic Committee for reconsideration to allow for additional resident input and for explanation of the Safe Approach Speed calculation with supporting information provided by OHM Advisors relative to their study of the intersection.

Kevin Nunning, 79 Melanie Lane, supports a Stop sign on Michael Drive. He reports that the cleaning service for his house was almost hit at the intersection and ended up in a front yard avoiding the crash.

Roch Morin, 6725 Michael Drive, stated that he is the president of Lamb's Other End subdivision. He supports no traffic control or a Yield sign at the intersection. Everyone must be vigilant when driving in a subdivision. He believes that a Stop sign may create a false sense of security as drivers on Melanie Lane may assume that a driver on Michael Drive is going to stop.

Jennifer Walters, 84 Melanie Lane, supports a Stop sign at the intersection. She reports that there are sixteen (16) children living on Melanie Lane. She has almost been involved in three (3) crashes at the intersection and ended up in the front yard of 43 Melanie Lane while avoiding a collision. There may not be reported crashes, but there have been several near misses. There is a "rush hour" in the subdivision as most residents have school age children and work. She defers to the expert recommendation by OHM Advisors. A three (3) foot tall child is much more difficult to see than a approaching vehicle.

Justin John, 6765 Michael, supports no traffic control or a Yield sign at the intersection. He rarely see traffic when he travels through the intersection, but knows to yield to oncoming traffic if present. He reviewed eighteen (18) intersections in the one-square mile section, centered on Livernois, and found that four (4) intersections had Stop signs; eight (8) had Yield signs; and the remaining intersections had no traffic control. He feels that a Stop sign is excessive for this location.

Al Ferguson, 6737 Michael Drive, is opposed to a Stop sign. He has counted the number of encounters he has had with opposing traffic since the original notice to residents was sent and he personally has had no conflicts with other vehicles in his over 50 trips through the intersection. The OHM Advisors recommendation is based on a Safe Approach Speed of 9.8 mph which is very near the 10 mph limit and he believes that a Yield sign should be permissable. He noted a "typo" in the original report delineating obstructions in the "northeast corner" when in actuality the obstruction used in the calculation is in the "northwest corner". The tree (obstruction) in question is 22 feet off the road and the measurement is inexact at best. Mr. Feguson referenced Mr. John's study of similar intersections and stated that other locations that have Stop signs have vision obstructions such as berms or trees that obstruct vision down to the ground.

Mr. Feguson continued that there have been no crashes at the intersection in his 12 ½ years living in this subdivision. He would support a Yield sign if that would provide more clear direction as to right-of-way at the intersection. Stop signs should not be installed at locations where they are not warranted. He travels through the intersection at all times of the day and does not feel there is an issue with right-of-way. Mr. Ferguson submitted a letter to the Traffic Committee opposed to the installation of a Stop sign. The letter was signed by ten (10) residents on Michael Drive.

Mr. Morin stated that when he sees kids on the roads or sidewalks he slows down or stops.

Mr. Ferguson asked that the Traffic Committee take into consideration the ten (10) residents on Michael Drive that signed the letter opposing a Stop sign. He stated that there is no data that supports a Stop sign. He feels that you should not place a sign based on one person's request.

There was general discussion regarding aggressive drivers and what assistance Troy Police could offer.

Mr. Huber asked about "Children at Play" signs. These types of signs are not installed in Troy as the Michigan Vehicle Code prohibits the installation of any sign that is not specified in the Michigan Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MMUTCD). These types of signs show no evidence of having reduced pedestrian crashes or vehicle speeds. "Children at Play" signs create a false sense of security for parents and children. Motorists have been found to pay little attention to them. Playing in the street is unsafe and illegal.

Resolution # 2015-10-45
Moved by Petrulis
Seconded by Brandstetter

WHEREAS, the Traffic Committee passed a resolution at its September 16, 2015 meeting recommending that the intersection of Melanie Lane at Michael Drive be MODIFIED from NO traffic control to ONE-WAY STOP control with a sign on the southbound Michael Drive approach to Melanie Lane; and

WHEREAS, the recommendation was brought back to the Traffic Committee for reconsideration to allow for additional resident input and for explanation of the Safe Approach Speed calculation with supporting information provided by OHM Advisors relative to their study of the intersection;

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Traffic Committee approves reconsideration of its recommendation for a traffic control deivce at the intersection of Michael Drive at Melanie Lane.

Yes: Brandstetter, Huber, Petrulis, Ziegenfelder
No: None
Absent: Easterbrook, Kilmer, Wilsher

Steve Dearing, traffic engineering consultant, was present at the meeting to discuss the report prepared by OHM Advisors for the intersection of Michael Drive at Melanie Lane. Mr. Dearing provided a history of traffic control devices and their use. In short, the Michigan Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MMUTCD) is adopted by the Michigan Vehicle Code and is the basis of law. He continued in discussing how, when and where do you pick a Stop vs a Yield sign vs uncontrolled.

Traffic control in a residential area can be very emotional and the goal behind the Safe Approach Speed (SAS) calculation is to make the placement of traffic control objective rather than subjective. The SAS goes back to the early 1960's when the concept was originally developed by AAA to determine if an intersection is restricted enough to limit a driver's ability

to see a conflict. Over the years a rational method was developed based on nomographs that was turned into a calculation. The calculation is conservative by nature and based on worst case scenarios. There is engineering judgment used as the calculation provides a value based on the input provided. There is no perfect safety and the placement of traffic control looks at risk management in a conservative nature. In the end, an intersection study is based on a judgment call.

Mr. Petrulis discussed driver behavior at Stop and Yield signs based on his experiences as a driver.

Mr. Ziegenfelder stated that he is always in favor of traffic control devices at an intersection. He believes that Stop signs provide much clearer guidance in the event of a crash.

Mr. Petrulis did review the intersection and said that he did not notice any significant obstructions on the corners. He feels that a Stop or Yield sign would be appropriate but has concerns about how effective a Stop sign would be if drivers don't believe it is warranted and may treat it as a Yield sign.

Mr. Brandstetter shared similar concerns in that a Stop sign my create a false sense of security at this particular location.

Resolution # 2015-10-46
Moved by Huber
Seconded by Brandstter

RESOLVED, that the intersection of Melanie Lane at Michael Drive be MODIFIED from NO traffic control to a YIELD sign on the southbound Michael Drive approach to Melanie Lane.

Yes:	Brandstetter, Huber, Petrulis, Ziegenfelder
No:	None
Absent:	Easterbrook, Kilmer, Wilsher

MOTION CARRIED

A question was posed by Ms. Walters regarding liability of the City based on the published study by OHM Advisors recommending a Stop sign. Mr. Dearing addressed the question by discussing tort liability. The State has exempted executive decisions such as those of fundamental policy. Whether to install a traffic control device, such as a Stop or Yield sign, is an issue where you exercise judgment and so is considered protected from claims of tort liability. The judgment is based on information provided and the executive action or approval is based on the best interests of the City.

4. Public Comment

There was no additonal public comment.

5. Other Business

An update on the status of the pathway program was provided.

6. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Pete Ziegenfelder, Chairperson

Bill Huotari, Deputy City Engineer/Traffic Engineer

G:\Traffic\aaa Traffic Committee\2015\10_October 21\Minutes_10212015_FINAL.docx