



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Date: December 3, 2015

To: Brian Kischnick, City Manager

From: MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager
David Roberts, Fire Chief

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award – Architectural/Engineering Services for Fire Station #4 (Introduced by David Roberts, Fire Chief and MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager)

History

Fire Station #4 was originally constructed in 1968. The station was remodeled in 1988 to include an additional apparatus bay and a small addition to the day room. Since this time, the station has taken on newer and larger apparatus; more volunteer firefighters; and the building has experienced foundation settling which has led to water leaks and structural deterioration.

This is the only station in the city that does not have drive-through apparatus bays which allow for the large vehicles to be pulled in and out of the building. Instead, the trucks must be pulled out but then backed in. The apparatus bays and overhead doors are substandard in size thereby making the task of backing apparatus at increased risk of damage to the vehicles and the building.

In February of 2013, a needs assessment study was performed by Redstone Architects, Inc., of Bloomfield Hills, MI, to identify current site and building conditions, and to determine the feasibility for a new fire station on the site. The study revealed that additional property would be needed to accommodate a new fire station in order to meet the future needs of the fire department while keeping the current fire station operational during construction.

On March 29, 2014, as part of the combined City Council-City Staff Retreat, City Council members and staff toured Station #4 to witness first-hand, many of the short-comings with the current facility. For the 2014-2015 budget, the replacement of Fire Station #4 was identified as one of the City's and Council's budget priorities.

Purchasing

- In November of 2014, negotiations began to purchase the property immediately east of Fire Station #4 in order to expand the site to accommodate a new fire station. After reviewing the necessary property appraisal and similar sales in that area, the property was eventually purchased on March 27, 2015, for the sum of \$175,000.00.
- August 24, 2015 a Request for Proposal was issued and posted on the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) website; www.mitn.info.
- 328 firms were notified of this bid opportunity of which 12 were Firms located in Troy.
- September 3, 2015 a Pre-Proposal meeting was held at Station #4. The Request for Proposal document and the project timeline was reviewed. Clarifications were discussed and questions answered which necessitated the issuance of an Addendum summarizing the meeting. Sixteen (16) firms attended the Pre-Proposal meeting as listed below:



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

Niagra Murano, LLC	Birmingham, MI
French Associates	Rochester, MI
CHMP, Inc.	Grand Blanc, MI
SDA Architects, Inc.	Clinton, MI
Sidock Architects, Inc.	Wyandotte, MI
Partners in Architecture	Mt.Clemens, MI
Redstone Architects, Inc.	Bloomfield Hills, MI
Integrated Design Solutions	Troy, MI
Ehresman Associates, Inc.	Troy, MI
Kohler Architecture, Inc.	Monroe, MI
DiClemente Siegel Design, Inc.	Southfield, MI
Fleis & VanDenBrink Engineering, Inc.	Grand Rapids, MI
NORR	Detroit, MI
Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc.	Bloomfield Hills, MI
MEP Engineers, LLC	Farmington Hills, MI
GAV & Associates, Inc.	Farmington Hills, MI

- September 24, 2015, a bid opening was conducted and Proposals were received as required by City Charter and Code for the Architectural/Engineering Services for Fire Station #4. Below is a summary of potential firms.

Companies notified via MITN	328
Troy Companies notified via MITN	12
Troy Companies - Active email Notification	11
Troy Companies - Active Free	1
Companies that viewed the bid	64
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	6

MITN provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy. **Active MITN** members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City. **Active MITN non-paying** members are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City. **Inactive MITN member** status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.

- (8) Proposal responses were received as detailed:

Sidock Architects, Inc.	Wyandotte, MI
Ehresman Associates, Inc.	Troy, MI
SDA Architects, Inc.	Clinton, MI
Kohler Architecture	Monroe, MI
Redstone Architects, Inc.	Bloomfield Hills, MI
Niagra Murano, LLC	Birmingham, MI
Partners in Architecture, PLC	Mt.Clemens, MI
CHMP, Inc.	Grand Blanc, MI

- Qualifying conditions of the Architectural Firm were:
 - Experience and knowledge of design and construction specifically for Fire Stations. Each firm submitting a proposal was required to submit a complete list of similar projects for the last five (5) years and was required to include a *minimum* of three (3) similar Fire Station projects.
 - Positive References specifically relating to Fire Station design.
 - Qualifications of Firm to perform project as specified detailing personnel and project team led by a project manager.
 - Work plan and methodology
 - Response to the questionnaire.



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

- Scoring criteria was as follows:
 - 40% Proposal Score
 - 20% Price Score
 - 40% Interview Score
- Five (5) Committee Members reviewed and evaluated the proposals. The Committee Members were as follows:
 - David Roberts, Fire Chief
 - Peter Hullinger, Fire Technician
 - Mark Miller, Director of Economic & Community Development
 - Brent Savidant, Planning Director
 - Steve Pallotta, Director of Building Operations
- Based on the Firms' qualifying conditions and scores for proposal and price; the top four (4) Firms were interviewed by the full committee on Friday, October 23, 2015.
- The top four (4) rated Firms were:
 - Sidock Architects
 - Redstone Architects
 - CHMP, Inc.
 - SDA Architects, Inc.
- Based on the top four (4) Firms' scores for proposal, price *and* interview; final interview presentations were held for the top two (2) ranked Firms on Wednesday, November 4, 2015.
 - Sidock Architects
 - Redstone Architects
- The final interview gave the top two (2) Firms the opportunity to present to the full evaluation committee; addressing three areas of concern: community engagement; site considerations; and budget considerations.
- Based on the scoring criteria, the committee unanimously recommended awarding the contract to the highest rated proposer, *Redstone Architects, Inc. of Bloomfield Hills, MI*. The Scoring Summary is attached.
- Redstone Architects, Inc., is a nationally recognized leader in the design of Fire Stations and public safety facilities with over 20 years of experience specifically in Fire Station design. The firm specializes in public safety and municipal projects.
- Redstone's Fire Station resume is quite extensive. Some recent projects include:
 - Central Fire Station, Monroe, MI
 - Marshal Regional Law Enforcement Center, Marshall, MI
 - Fire Station No. 2, Southfield, MI
- The City of Troy Police Department and Fire Administration Headquarters were designed by Redstone Architects, Inc. in 2001.
- The Redstone Architects design team will be led by Principal in Charge Daniel Redstone, and Matt Berge, Project Architect/Manager. Consulting engineers will be:
 - Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc. – Consulting Civil Engineers & Landscape Architecture
 - DESAI/NASR Consulting Engineers, Inc. – Consulting Structural Engineers
 - JRED Engineering Inc. – Consulting Mechanical Engineers
 - ETS Engineers, Inc. – Consulting Electrical Engineers
- Also, the Request for Proposal (RFP) process is underway for a Construction Manager at Risk (CMR).
- The experience, wisdom, creativity and engineering skills of the Architects *and* CMR Firms will be combined in the planning phase in conjunction with the expertise and needs of the Fire Department. The CMR working together collaboratively with the Architectural team minimizes risk and ensures cost



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (Continued)

containment and provides opportunity for value engineering. The collaboration of the design and construction team will be critical to the construction of the Fire Station within budget.

- Included with this memo is a detailed *Tentative* Project Timeline. The *Tentative* Project Timeline indicates the CMR contract recommendation would be presented to City Council March, 2016. Construction would begin October of 2016 and construction completion would be October, 2017 in time for Fire Prevention Week.
- Recent Fire Station square footage costs have been in the \$300 - \$400 per square foot price range.

Financial

\$4,000,000.00 is budgeted in the 2015/2016 Capital Fund Account for this project. The Project# is 20160018.

Recommendation

City management recommends awarding a contract to perform the Architectural/Engineering Services for the City of Troy Fire Station #4 to the highest rated proposer, *Redstone Architects, Inc. of Bloomfield Hills, MI* as a result of a best value evaluation process for a total not to exceed amount of \$201,042.00 at prices contained in the bid tabulation opened September 24, 2015. The award is contingent upon the Firm's submission of properly executed bid documents including insurance certificates and all specified requirements.

WEIGHTED FINAL SCORING

Architectural Services for the Troy Fire Station #4 Final Score Calculation:

40%	Proposal Score (100 point base)
20%	Price Score (100 point base)
40%	Interview Score (100 point base)
100%	

Weighted Average Score for Proposals: 40%

Raters:	1	2	3	4	5	Average	Final Weighted
Firms:							
Partners in Architecture, PLC	85	84	35	80	45	65.8	26.32
SDA Architects, Inc.	90	84	34	85	70	72.6	29.04
Ehresman Associates, Inc.	80	90	19	100	55	68.8	27.52
Niagara Murano, LLC	90	89	23	96	20	63.6	25.44
Sidock Architects	100	100	100	100	85	97	38.80
CHMP, Inc.	95	98	75	85	75	85.6	34.24
Redstone Architects, Inc.	100	99	100	100	85	96.8	38.72
Kohler Architecture, Inc.	90	80	75	57	80	76.4	30.56

Weighted Average Score for Price: 20%

Raters:	Weighted Criteria - Difference in Costs {1-(Proposal price - lowest price)/low price} x available points		Final Weighted Score (x.20)
Firms:			
Partners in Architecture, PLC	\$ 148,250.00	100	20.00
SDA Architects, Inc.	\$ 151,100.00	98	19.62
Ehresman Associates, Inc.	\$ 164,300.00	89	17.83
Sidock Architects	\$ 181,200.00	78	15.55
Niagara Murano, LLC	\$ 181,900.00	77	15.46
CHMP, Inc.	\$ 190,000.00	72	14.37
Redstone Architects, Inc.	\$ 201,250.00	64	12.85
Kohler Architecture, Inc.	\$ 220,000.00	52	10.32

Firms:	Partners in Architecture, PLC	SDA Architects, Inc.	Ehresman Associates, Inc.	Sidock Architects	Niagara Murano, LLC	CHMP, Inc.	Redstone Architects, Inc.	Kohler Architecture, Inc.
Proposal Score	26.32	29.04	27.52	38.80	25.44	34.24	38.72	30.56
Price Score	20.00	19.62	17.83	15.55	15.46	14.37	12.85	10.32
SCORE	46.32	48.66	45.35	54.35	40.90	48.61	51.57	40.88

Architectural Services for the Troy Fire Station #4 Final Score Calculation (continued):

Summary: Proposal and Price Scores

Weighted Average Score for Interviews: 40%

Raters:	1	2	3	4	5	Average	Final Weighted
Firms:							
Redstone Architects, Inc.	90	97	100	95	98	96	38.40
SDA Architects, Inc.	87	92	40	87	63	73.8	29.52
CHMP, Inc.	94	97	80	92	64	85.4	34.16
Sidock Architects	87	87	100	93	97	92.8	37.12

SCORE:

Firms:	SDA Architects, Inc.	Sidock Architects	CHMP, Inc.	Redstone Architects, Inc.
Proposal Score	29.04	38.80	34.24	38.72
Price Score	19.62	15.55	14.37	12.85
Interview Score	29.52	37.12	34.16	38.40
SCORE	78.18	91.47	82.77	89.97

Weighted Average Score for Interview #2/Presentations: 40%

Raters:	1	2	3	4	5	Average	Final Weighted
Firms:							
Redstone Architects, Inc.	100	100	100	100	100	100	40.00
Sidock Architects	50	85	50	60	50	59	23.60

Firms:	Sidock Architects	Redstone Architects, Inc.
Proposal Score	38.80	38.72
Price Score	15.55	12.85
Interview Score	30.36	39.20
FINAL SCORE	84.71	90.77

Tentative -- Fire Station #4 Project Timeline -- Tentative

	2015			2016									2017															
	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	
Award AE Contract																												
Demolish House (in progress)																												
Execute AE Contract																												
Survey/Utility Investigations																												
CMR RFP																												
CMR Proposals Due																												
Award CMR Contract																												
Execute CMR Contract																												
Prelim. AE Design & Stakeholders*																												
Preliminary Design AE/CMR *																												
Final Design AE/CMR & Bidding *																												
Receive/Negotiate/Award GMP *																												
Construction *																												
* Actual schedules for preliminary and final design, receipt of bids and construction will be developed by the AE/CMR team and approved by City of Troy.																												

DRAFT

November 11, 2015 -- Subject to Change

DRAFT

City of Troy Initiated

AE/CMR Initiated