The Regular Meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Schultz at 7:30 p.m. on May 13, 2008, in the Council Chambers of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:
Michael W. Hutson
Mark Maxwell
Philip Sanzica
Robert Schultz
Thomas Strat
John J. Tagle
Lon M. Ullmann

Absent:
Mark J. Vleck
Wayne Wright

Also Present:
Mark F. Miller, Planning Director
R. Brent Savidant, Principal Planner
Christopher Forsyth, Assistant City Attorney
Kathy Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

Note: *See page 12 for Resolution to Excuse absent members.*

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Resolution # PC-2008-05-055
Moved by: Tagle
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

3. MINUTES

Resolution # PC-2008-05-056
Moved by: Maxwell
Seconded by: Tagle

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of the April 22, 2008 Special/Study meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Items not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

SPECIAL USE REQUEST

5. PUBLIC HEARING – SPECIAL USE REQUEST (SU 357) – Proposed Granite City Food & Brewery Restaurant, South side of Big Beaver Road, East of Troy Center Drive, Section 28, O-S-C (Office Service Commercial) District

Mr. Miller presented a summary of the Planning Department report on the proposed Special Use request and Preliminary Site Plan approval. He addressed the relationship in terms of parking spaces between the proposed restaurant and the existing National City Center, formerly known as the Top of Troy. Mr. Miller noted a parking justification analysis was not in the hands of the Planning Department at the time the written report was prepared, but announced the petitioner distributed an analysis to the members prior to the beginning of tonight's meeting. Mr. Miller reported a Registered Architect did not seal the architectural sheets of the site plan submittal, as required; and further addressed discrepancies in notations shown on those sheets. Mr. Miller specifically addressed the proposed restaurant in terms of the key concepts and goals of the Big Beaver Corridor Study.

In summary, Mr. Miller said the Planning Commission must determine if the application meets the general special use approval standards of Section 03.31.05. Further, he noted a parking reduction of 735 spaces is required for the parent parcel upon which the National City Center presently sits, and a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) must be granted in relief of the 10-foot greenbelt requirement next to the I-75 right of way. Mr. Miller said the initial recommendation of the Planning Department was to postpone the item because the petitioner had not submitted a parking justification analysis.

Mr. Forsythe stated the Planning Commission has a fair amount of discretion in the approval process of a special use request.

Mr. Sanzica asked if the parking justification analysis alleviates the concerns of the Planning Department with respect to the proposed parking space reduction.

Mr. Miller replied that he would prefer the petitioner to submit a more scientific parking justification analysis.

Mr. Ullmann addressed the proposed parking space reduction and the implementation of the Big Beaver Corridor Study. He asked if the Planning Commission could ask the petitioner to place the building closer to Big Beaver Road.

Mr. Miller said his gut feeling is the site has enough parking with the proposed parking space reduction, but indicated the analysis is not showing conclusive signs of that assumption. Mr. Miller said the proposal would be more in compliance with the Big Beaver Corridor Study if the building was located at the 30-foot front yard setback line and had no parking in front of the building. He acknowledged the proposed site plan meets all of the Zoning Ordinance requirements. He addressed the evolution of developments relative to the key elements and goals of the Big Beaver Corridor Study. Mr. Miller said the City currently does not have standards to implement the Big Beaver Corridor Study, but noted the City is in the process of establishing Big Beaver Road design and development standards.

Mr. Forsythe briefly addressed other developments in which petitioners have worked with the City to bring forward their buildings to the Big Beaver Road right-of-way; i.e., Mitchell's Ocean Prime and Starbucks.

The petitioner, James Butler of Professional Engineering Associates, 2430 Rochester Court, Troy, was present. He introduced Tony Antone of Kojaian Management Corporation. Mr. Butler addressed the architectural plans and provided an explanation of the floor plans. He addressed the relationship of the proposed building to the Big Beaver Corridor Study and identified major concerns in moving the building closer to Big Beaver Road. Mr. Butler said there are currently three easements that affect the subject property along the frontage of Big Beaver Road; Michigan Bell (AT&T) easement, a 50-foot wide drainage easement and a sanitary sewer easement. He noted that the easements are super-imposed on the site plan, and shown directly on the survey. Mr. Butler said another concern in moving the building forward would be a sight line issue with the National City Bank Branch.

Tony Antone of Kojaian Management Corporation, 39400 Woodward Avenue, Bloomfield Hills, was present. Mr. Antone addressed the hurdles in relation to the Big Beaver Corridor Study; the sight line of the National City Bank Branch and the three easements along Big Beaver Road. He specifically addressed the parking study analysis that he distributed to members prior to the beginning of tonight's meeting. Mr. Antone said they are very comfortable with the number of parking spaces proposed and apologized for the unscientific nature of the parking analysis. Mr. Antone introduced Wade Behm, a representative from Granite City Food & Brewery Restaurant.

Wade Behm of Granite City Food & Brewery Restaurant, Sioux Falls, South Dakota, displayed building materials, a front elevation rendering, and a photograph of an existing restaurant. He said the I-75 and Big Beaver Road traffic is a big draw for the new location. Mr. Behm said they hope to open the restaurant by late January, or early February.

Mr. Sanzica asked about the microbrewery portion of the restaurant and the relationship of Granite City's menu to Ruth's Chris Steak House menu.

Mr. Behm said the restaurant is an upscale, casual dining establishment with modern American cuisine, and noted it is far from being a steak house. He said the restaurant contains a component of a microbrewery, and indicated there are no tanks or grain storage on site. Mr. Behm said the average meal cost is $13.50.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

No one was present to speak.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Discussion continued on the easements and the sight line of the National City Bank Branch.

Mr. Hutson asked if there is a contractual obligation with National City on sight lines.

Mr. Antone replied he could not answer that question without further research. He said he knows National City is not expecting any advancement past their building sight lines.

Mr. Hutson said he is not ready to vote on this item tonight. He would like the petitioner to come back with a complete application submission with sealed drawings and a scientific parking justification analysis. Mr. Hutson emphasized the discretion that the Planning Commission has on the placement of the building in relation to the Big Beaver Corridor Study.

Mr. Strat concurred. He would like to see a complete application submission and advised of a contractual agreement should one exist with National City. Mr. Strat addressed the orientation of the building, the sight lines of the National City Bank Branch, the traffic flow and parking reduction. Mr. Strat said he is confident the petitioner can accomplish placement of the building, or terrace, closer to Big Beaver Road.

Mr. Tagle agreed. He said it would be beneficial to see a study on how far the building could be moved forward before any sight lines are disturbed, and the impact of moving the building forward as relates to the three easements.

Chair Schultz agreed and does not support going forward with the proposal as submitted. He addressed the restaurant location at a major entry point into the City and the diligent effort to implement the Big Beaver Corridor Study. He asked the petitioner to bring back a complete application submission that addresses the concerns discussed tonight. Chair Schultz addressed the sight line of the National City Bank Branch, and said anyone driving on Big Beaver Road or I-75 can see where National City is because of its large, illuminated sign.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-057
Moved by: Strat
Seconded by: Hutson

RESOLVED, To postpone this item until the next earliest possible agenda at the discretion of the Planning Department and until such time as all documents requested have been presented.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

The petitioner was strongly encouraged to submit a parking justification analysis that meets the standards of the Planning Department.

Mr. Strat expressed that the Planning Commission wants to cooperate with the petitioner. He indicated he is inclined to agree with the petitioner's comments on parking and encouraged the petitioner to incorporate those findings in the parking justification analysis.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

Chair Schultz announced that the Public Hearing would remain open.

SITE PLAN REVIEWS

6. SITE PLAN REVIEW (SU 282-C) – Proposed Atrium Expansion, Kensington Community Church, Northwest corner of Square Lake and John R, Section 2, R-1D (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Savidant presented a summary of the Planning Department report on the proposed site plan, and reported it is the recommendation of City Management to approve the site plan as submitted.

Mr. Hutson addressed walkability of the City, and asked if the petitioner planned to put a sidewalk on the north side of the church.

Mr. Savidant said the church received a sidewalk waiver and is not required to show a sidewalk on the site plan. He indicated the sidewalk waiver is for an indefinite period of time.

Christopher Aller of Steven Auger & Associates (SA+A) Architects, 27 S. Broadway, Lake Orion, was present to represent Kensington Community Church. Mr. Aller

briefly addressed objectives of the church for the proposed addition, and stated the addition would not increase the intensity of the site.

Mr. Strat asked if the church would be receptive to putting in a sidewalk.

Mr. Maxwell asked if the church would be receptive to planting additional trees.

Mr. Aller believes the church would have no objections to putting in a sidewalk or planting additional trees across the front property. He further indicated that the parking lot appears to be adequate for the church membership.

Mr. Tagle asked if there are future plans for a specific quadrant of the subject site.

Mr. Aller said there has been discussion of a new auditorium or activity (gymnasium) room, but there are no definite plans at this time.

Resolution # PC-2008-05- (motion amended)
Moved by: Hutson
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, That the proposed Atrium Expansion, Kensington Community Church, located on the northwest corner of Square Lake and John R, Section 2, approximately 36.7 acres, within the R-1D zoning district, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. That a sidewalk be placed in the area where a waiver has been granted.
2. That the petitioner plant twelve (12) additional trees in the green space area.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Discussion continued on the sidewalk in relation to:
- Property to the north leading nowhere.
- Future development of properties to the north.
- Wetlands and grade changes along John R.
- Appeal process for sidewalk waivers.
- “Sidewalk Ends” signage.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-058
Moved by: Hutson
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, To amend the motion on the floor to delete the requirement that a sidewalk be placed at this point in time.

Discussion on the amendment to the motion on the floor.

Mr. Strat agreed to the amendment but noted that the Temple on South Boulevard and Adams placed a sidewalk across their wetlands, at the request of the Planning Commission.

Mr. Miller addressed the Zoning Ordinance as relates to sidewalk requirements, the authority of the Traffic Committee, and engineering design and development standards.

Vote on the amendment to the motion on the floor.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

Vote on the motion as amended.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-059
Moved by: Hutson
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, That the proposed Atrium Expansion, Kensington Community Church, located on the northwest corner of Square Lake and John R, Section 2, approximately 36.7 acres, within the R-1D zoning district, be granted, subject to the following condition:

1. That the petitioner plant twelve (12) additional trees in the green space area.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

7. SITE PLAN REVIEW (SP 949) – Proposed Troy Market Place Outlot Restaurant, Southwest corner of Rochester Road and Big Beaver Road, Section 27, B-2 (Community Business) District

Mr. Savidant presented a summary of the Planning Department report on the proposed site plan, and reported it is the recommendation of City Management to approve the site plan as submitted with two conditions: 1) A variance is granted from the Board of Zoning Appeals as relates to the front yard setback requirement; and 2) A shared parking agreement is developed with the retail center to the south prior to Final Site Plan approval.

The petitioner, Laith Hermiz of Ramco-Gershenson, Inc., 31500 Northwestern Hwy, Farmington Hills, was present. Mr. Hermiz introduced the project's consulting team present this evening: representatives from Wah Yee Architects, civil and landscape architects from Professional Engineering Associates (PEA), Michael Labadie of Wells+Associates, and neighboring property owner, Dan McLeish. Mr. Hermiz gave a brief introduction of Ramco-Gershenson. He addressed the site location, property description, landscaping and specific concepts of the site plan. Mr. Hermiz identified the retail use as Pei Wei restaurant, a fast, casual concept of the PF Chang restaurant.

Mike Labadie of Wells+Associates, 39555 Oakland Hill Place, Novi, gave a PowerPoint presentation of the shared parking analysis.

A brief question and answer session followed.

Chair Schultz commended the development. He encouraged the petitioner to add landscaping along the east side of the building as well as south of the tree line along Big Beaver Road to shield the parking lot.

Mr. Hermiz said the comments are well noted, and informed the members that they had considered landscaping along the entry drive. Mr. Hermiz indicated that a major storm drain runs along that border and they have concerns with what types of plantings and how many plantings could be placed there, and how that might affect the shallow storm drain.

Mr. Tagle suggested large planter boxes as an alternative. Mr. Tagle also encouraged some type of low nature landscaping to the south of the building as a screening between the dumpster enclosure area and loading zone.

Mr. Hermiz said that would be no problem.

Mr. Strat commended the architect on an excellent job and the client on allowing the architect to be creative.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-060
Moved by: Sanzica
Seconded by: Maxwell

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves a reduction in the number of required parking spaces for the Troy Market Place Outlot restaurant and retail building to 24 when a total of 63 spaces are required on the site based on the off-street parking space requirements for restaurant and retail uses, as per Article XL. This 39-space reduction is justified through shared parking, as outlined in the parking study prepared by Wells+Associates, and therefore meets the standards of Article 40.20.12.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That the proposed Troy Market Place Outlot restaurant and retail building, located on the southwest corner of Rochester Road and Big Beaver Road, Section 27, approximately 0.63 acres, within the B-2 zoning district, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant is required to receive a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals from Section 30.20.05, to permit a 15-foot front yard setback where a 75-foot front yard setback is required.
2. A shared parking agreement shall be developed with the retail center to the south prior to Final Site Plan Approval.
3. That the recommendations as far as landscaping be implemented as proposed by the Planning Commission.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

_____

Chair Schultz requested a recess at 9:20 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 9:30 p.m.

_____

8. SITE PLAN REVIEW (SP 305-J and SP 305-I) – Proposed Permanent Roof Top Module Units and Minor Care Units, William Beaumont Hospital, West side of Dequindre, South of South Blvd. (44201 Dequindre), Section 1, Zoned C-F (Community Facilities) and E-P (Environmental Protection) District

Mr. Savidant presented a summary of the Planning Department report on the proposed site plans, and reported it is the recommendation of City Management to approve both plans as submitted, with the condition to show the pedestrian bridge across Dequindre on the Final Site Plan relating to the Minor Care Unit. Mr. Savidant said approval also could be conditioned on the removal of the temporary Minor Care Unit by March 31, 2013.

Mr. Hutson questioned the representation of the petitioner as relates to temporary and permanent structures.

Chair Schultz asked if the Planning Department verified with the petitioner their intent to build the pedestrian bridge, since the site plan submission did not show the bridge.

Mr. Savidant replied the petitioner could address the temporary and permanent structures. He further informed the members that the Planning Department did not verify the petitioner's intent to build the pedestrian bridge.

The petitioner, Eric Gray of Beaumont Services Company, 44201 Dequindre Road, Troy, was present. Mr. Gray introduced Beaumont Hospital representatives present at tonight's meeting: Tom Brisse, Senior Vice President and Hospital Director, and Bob Rubrich, Director of Facilities Development. Mr. Gray provided a clarification and explanation on the hospital's decision to go from a temporary roof top module unit to a permanent second story addition.

Mr. Hutson said he feels betrayed by the hospital representatives with their request for site plan approval of a permanent roof top structure, when the members were reticent on site plan approval for the temporary units in February.

Chair Schultz asked if a plan to construct a pedestrian bridge across Dequindre was still in place.

Mr. Gray indicated the pedestrian bridge is currently under construction and the omission of the bridge on the site plan was an error on their part.

Chair Schultz asked if the Commission would see the petitioner back in approximately ninety days to request approval of a permanent minor care unit, should approval be granted tonight for a temporary minor care unit.

Mr. Gray explained that demands of the hospital and community, as well as cost factors, determined that it would be beneficial to construct a permanent second story addition instead of temporary roof top modules. Mr. Gray displayed renderings. He detailed site plan features and uses relating to both the permanent second story addition and minor care unit.

Tom Brisse addressed the trust relationship between the City and the hospital and offered a re-characterization of the matter. He focused on the hospital demands, capacity, and cost factors that resulted in their determination to go with a permanent second story addition.

Mr. Gray addressed the construction building materials proposed for the permanent second story addition.

Chair Schultz asked the petitioner not to come back before the Commission with a request to make the temporary Minor Care Unit a permanent structure.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-061
Moved by: Tagle
Seconded by: Hutson

RESOLVED, That the proposed Second Floor Roof Top Addition and Minor Care Unit, William Beaumont Hospital, located on the west side of Dequindre, south of South Boulevard, Section 1, approximately 67.695 acres, within the C-F and E-P zoning districts, be granted, subject to the following condition:

1. Show the pedestrian bridge across Dequindre on the Final Site Plan.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Strat commended the petitioner on the hospital expansion.

OTHER ITEMS

9. FINAL REPORT FROM TROY HISTORIC DISTRICT STUDY COMMITTEE – Proposal to Revise Boundaries of the Historic District at the Troy Museum and Historic Village to Include Newly Acquired Property

Mr. Miller gave a brief review on the proposed expansion of the Troy Museum and Historic Village.

There was discussion on the relevance of a particular document attached to the background material of the report submitted by the Troy Historic District Study Committee. The document, created by Paul Lin, has a subject line titled “New Master Plan Suggestions”.

Mr. Hutson suggested excluding the written correspondence of Paul Lin’s, so it could not be construed as part of the Historic District report.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-062
Moved by: Hutson
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, To exclude Paul Lin’s letter.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

Resolution # PC-2008-05-063
Moved by: Hutson
Seconded by: Strat

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission accepts the Final Report and supports the expansion of the Historic District classification for the Museum Properties, as recommended in the Final Report of the Historic District Study Committee.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

10. CITY OF TROY MASTER PLAN – Planning Commission Update

Mr. Miller reviewed the status of the Master Plan. Mr. Miller indicated concerns of the City Council would be addressed without any substantial effects to the Plan. He said the Plan with revisions would be ready for review at the June 3, 2008 Special/Study meeting.

11. PUBLIC COMMENTS – Items on Current Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

Resolution # PC-2008-05-064
Moved by: Sanzica
Seconded by: Tagle

RESOLVED, That Members Vleck and Wright are excused from attendance at this meeting for personal reasons.

Yes: All present (7)
Absent: Vleck, Wright

MOTION CARRIED

---

12. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENTS

Mr. Strat addressed code enforcement issues relating to service stations and White Chapel Cemetery. Mr. Strat encouraged members to attend the June Oakland County Planners Gathering that will have a presentation on roundabouts.

There were brief comments relating to code enforcement matters.

Mr. Hutson gave a rave review on the American Planning Association (APA) national conference, and shared various handouts with the members.

Mr. Tagle thanked staff on a well-prepared meeting and staff reports.

Mr. Miller reminded members that June 3rd is the next meeting.

Chair Schultz echoed Mr. Hutson's positive comments on the APA national conference. He briefly addressed digital electronic signs and the enforcement of site plans and landscape plans.

The Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 10:24 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

_____
Robert M. Schultz, Chair

_____
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\Planning Commission Minutes\2008 PC Minutes\Final\05-13-08 Regular Meeting_Final.doc