



## CITY COUNCIL ACTION REPORT

May 28, 2010

TO: John Szerlag, City Manager

FROM: John M. Lamerato, Assistant City Manager/Finance & Administration  
Susan A. Leirstein, Purchasing Director  
Carol K. Anderson, Parks and Recreation Director

SUBJECT: Standard Purchasing Resolution 1: - Award to Low Bidder – Tree Maintenance Services

### **Background:**

- On May 10, 2010, City Council adopted a budget for FY 2010/11, which included the elimination of two (2) AFSCME tree trimmer positions through layoff.
- On April 29, 2010, bid proposals were received to provide tree and stump maintenance services for the City of Troy for three (3) years, with an option to renew for one additional year.
- 142 vendors were notified via the MITN system and three (3) complete bids were received as well as one statement of no bid.
- Due to anticipated staff reductions which include two (2) AFSCME tree trimmers and all seasonal laborers, it will be necessary to contract tree maintenance services in order to continue to deliver the service to the community.
- As part of the bid process, City staff was given a chance to compete for the work against the bids received. City staff prepared and submitted a bid proposal which is included in the attached bid tabulation. However, the significant rental cost of the equipment to perform this work (tower trucks, chipper trucks, chippers, stump grinder, dump trucks) increased the bid to the point where the City proposal was not competitive with the low bidder.
- Based on the cost savings, City management is recommending a contract be awarded to J.H. Hart Urban Forestry to provide tree and stump maintenance services.

### **Financial Considerations:**

- Funds are available in the contractual service accounts of the Parks and Recreation Department, and Public Works Department budgets.
- Due to the significant rental cost of the equipment needed to perform this work, the City will realize a savings of approximately \$118,531.00 a year by contracting out these services.

### **Legal Considerations:**

- ITB-COT 10-14, Tree and Stump Maintenance Services was competitively bid as required by City Charter and Code.
- The award is contingent upon contractor's submission of properly executed contract and bid documents, including insurance certificates and all other specified requirements.

### **Recommendations:**

- City management and the Parks and Recreation Department recommend awarding a three-year contract for tree and stump maintenance services with an option to renew for one additional year to the low bidder, J. H. Hart Urban Forestry of Sterling Heights for an estimated annual cost of \$283,106.00 at unit prices contained in the attached bid tabulation and schedule of values to expire July 1, 2013.

VENDOR NAME:

**	<b>J.H. Hart Urban</b>	City of Troy	Shock Brothers Tree
	<b>Forestry</b>	Employee Proposal	Care
Check Number	016921	N/A	9105104361
Amount	<b>\$10,000.00</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>\$10,000.00</b>

**PROPOSAL -- FURNISH THREE (3) YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF TREE/STUMP REMOVAL SERVICES WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR AN ADDITIONAL YEAR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE SPECIFICATIONS**

**PROPOSAL "A"**

<b>TREE REMOVAL</b>	<u>150 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>
	Provide three-man tree removal crews, all equipment, saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic controls etc	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	Typical Crew Size	Typical Crew Size
		<b>\$ 119.94</b>	\$ 200.58	\$ 165.00
	Overtime:	<b>Hour/3man Crew</b>	Hour/3man Crew	Hour/3man Crew
		<b>\$ 119.94</b>	N/A	\$ 210.00
	Holiday Time:	<b>Hour/3man Crew</b>	N/A	Hour/3man Crew
		<b>\$ 119.94</b>	N/A	\$ 210.00
		<b>Hour/3man Crew</b>		Hour/3man Crew

**PROPOSAL "B"**

<b>STUMP REMOVAL</b>	<u>500 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>
	Provide a stumping crew including all equipment for removal and grinding of the stumps.	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	Typical Crew Size	Typical Crew Size
		<b>\$ 84.56</b>	\$ 96.19	\$ 110.00
	Overtime:	<b>Hour/1-Man Crew</b>	Hour/2-Man Crew	Hour/2-Man Crew
		<b>\$ 84.56</b>	N/A	\$ 140.00
	Holiday Time:	<b>Hour/1-Man Crew</b>	N/A	Hour/2-Man Crew
		<b>\$ 84.56</b>	N/A	\$ 140.00
		<b>Hour/1-Man Crew</b>		Hour/2-Man Crew

**PROPOSAL "C"**

<b>BLOCK PRUNING</b>	<u>2,300 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	<b>2 Men (1 Crew)</b>	<b>2 Men (1 Crew)</b>	<b>4 Men (2 Crews)</b>
	Provide two crews consisting of two-men, two aerial towers & two chippers for tree pruning	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	Typical Crew Size	Typical Crew Size
		<b>\$ 85.02(x2)</b>	\$ 150.90	\$ 200.00
	Overtime:	<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>	Hour/2-Man Crew	Hour/2-Crew of 2
		<b>\$ 85.02(x2)</b>	N/A	\$ 280.00
	Holiday Time:	<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>	N/A	Hour/2-Crew of 2
		<b>\$ 85.02(x2)</b>	N/A	\$ 280.00
		<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>		Hour/2-Crew of 2

**PROPOSAL "D"**

<b>SERVICE REQUEST RESPONSE</b>	<u>3,000 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty			
	Provide a two-man crew for individual pruning requests			
		<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>
	Regular:	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	Typical Crew Size	Typical Crew Size
		<b>\$ 85.02</b>	\$ 117.69	\$ 100.00
	Overtime:	<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>	Hour/2-Man Crew	Hour/2-Man Crew
		<b>\$ 85.02</b>	N/A	\$ 140.00
	Holiday Time:	<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>	N/A	Hour/2-Man Crew
		<b>\$ 85.02</b>	N/A	\$ 140.00
		<b>Hour/2-Man Crew</b>		Hour/2-Man Crew

**PROPOSAL "E"**

<b>STORM DAMAGE REMOVAL</b>	<u>100 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty			
	Provide a three-man crew for storm damage removal			
		<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>
	Overtime:	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	Typical Crew Size	Typical Crew Size
		<b>\$ 166.14</b>	\$ 329.51	\$ 210.00
	Holiday Time:	<b>Hour/3man Crew</b>	Hour/3man Crew	Hour/3man Crew
		<b>\$ 166.14</b>	\$ 329.51	\$ 210.00
		<b>Hour/3man Crew</b>	Hour/3man Crew	Hour/3man Crew

VENDOR NAME:

VENDOR NAME:		J.H. Hart Urban Forestry	City of Troy Employee Proposal	Shock Brothers Tree Care
<b>PROPOSAL "F"</b>				
<b>OPEN DRAIN TREE &amp; DEBRIS DAM REMOVAL</b>		100 Man Hours - Estimated Qty		
Provide a three-man crew for removal of Trees & debris		3	3	3
Regular:		Typical Crew Size \$ 119.94	Typical Crew Size \$ 195.77	Typical Crew Size \$ 180.00
Overtime:		Hour/3man Crew \$ 119.94	Hour/3man Crew N/A	Hour/3man Crew \$ 225.00
Holiday Time:		Hour/3man Crew \$ 119.94	Hour/3man Crew N/A	Hour/3man Crew \$ 225.00
		Hour/3man Crew		Hour/3man Crew
<b>ESTIMATED GRAND TOTAL PROPOSALS 'A-F':</b>		** \$ 283,106.46	\$ 401,638.32	\$ 313,737.00
<b>INSURANCE:</b>	Can Meet	XX		XX
	Cannot Meet			
<b>SITE INSPECTION:</b>	Y/N	Yes		Yes
	DATE	2004 - 2008		4/22/2010
<b>PROGRESS PAYMENTS:</b>		Weekly		14 Days
<b>CONTACT INFORMATION:</b>	Contact Name:	Judd Hart		Nick Shock
	24 Hr Phone #	248-755-1793		586-838-9241
	Cell Number	248-755-1793		586-489-5407
	Pager Number	248-755-1793		Blank
	Hrs of Operations	7:30 AM to 5 PM		7:30 AM to 4:30 PM
<b>EXTENDING TO MITN PURCHASING COOPERATIVE</b>	Y or N	No		No
<b>PAYMENT TERMS:</b>		14 Days		14 Days
<b>EXCEPTIONS:</b>		Attached To Bid		Blank
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: Signed</b>	Y or N	Yes		Yes
<b>PROPOSED PERSONNEL &amp; EQUIPMENT</b>	Attached: Y or N	Yes		Yes
<b>SCHEDULE OF VALUES: Attached</b>	Y or N	Yes		Yes

NO BIDS: Branch Tree Service

Clarification

ATTEST:

Thomas Rosewarne

Debra Painter- Deagle

Jeffrey Biegler

Kurt Bovensiep

Linda Bockstanz

\*\*BOLDFACE DENOTES LOW BIDDER

Susan Leirstein CPPO, CPPB  
 Purchasing Director

VENDOR NAME:

Owen Tree Service

Inc

Check Number

437896

Amount

\$10,000.00

**PROPOSAL -- FURNISH THREE (3) YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF TREE/STUMP REMOVAL SERVICES WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR AN ADDITIONAL YEAR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE SPECIFICATIONS**

**PROPOSAL "A"**

<u>TREE REMOVAL</u>	<u>150 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	3		
Provide three-man tree removal crews, all equipment, saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic controls etc		Typical Crew Size		
		\$ 165.00		
	Overtime:	Hour/3man Crew		
		\$ 210.00		
	Holiday Time:	Hour/3man Crew		
		\$ 330.00		
		Hour/3man Crew		

**PROPOSAL "B"**

<u>STUMP REMOVAL</u>	<u>500 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	2		
Provide a stumping crew including all equipment for removal and grinding of the stumps.		Typical Crew Size		
		\$ 125.00		
	Overtime:	Hour/2-Man Crew		
		\$ 160.00		
	Holiday Time:	Hour/2-Man Crew		
		\$ 300.00		
		Hour/2-Man Crew		

**PROPOSAL "C"**

<u>BLOCK PRUNING</u>	<u>2,300 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	4 Men (2 Crews)		
Provide two crews consisting of two-men, two aerial towers & two chippers for tree pruning		Typical Crew Size		
		\$ 220.00		
	Overtime:	Hour/2-Man Crew of 2		
		\$ 280.00		
	Holiday Time:	Hour/2-Man Crew of 2		
		\$ 400.00		
		Hour/2-Man Crew of 2		

**PROPOSAL "D"**

<u>SERVICE REQUEST RESPONSE</u>	<u>3,000 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	2		
Provide a two-man crew for individual pruning requests		Typical Crew Size		
		\$ 110.00		
	Regular:	Hour/2-Man Crew		
	Overtime:	\$ 140.00		
	Holiday Time:	Hour/2-Man Crew		
		\$ 200.00		
		Hour/2-Man Crew		

**PROPOSAL "E"**

<u>STORM DAMAGE REMOVAL</u>	<u>100 Man Hours</u> - Estimated Qty	3		
Provide a three-man crew for storm damage removal		Typical Crew Size		
		\$ 330.00		
	Overtime:	Hour/3man Crew		
	Holiday Time:	\$ 330.00		
		Hour/3man Crew		

VENDOR NAME:

Owen Tree Service  
 Inc

**PROPOSAL "F"**

**OPEN DRAIN TREE & DEBRIS DAM REMOVAL**

Provide a three-man crew for removal of  
 Trees & debris

100 Man Hours - Estimated Qty

3

Typical Crew Size

Regular:

\$ 165.00

Overtime:

\$ 210.00

Holiday Time:

Hour/3man Crew  
 \$ 380.00

Hour/3man Crew

**ESTIMATED GRAND TOTAL PROPOSALS 'A-F':**

**\$ 347,483.50**

**INSURANCE:**

Can Meet  
 Cannot Meet

XX

**SITE INSPECTION:**

Y/N  
 DATE

Yes

Blank

**PROGRESS PAYMENTS:**

Weekly

**CONTACT INFORMATION:**

Contact Name:  
 24 Hr Phone #  
 Cell Number  
 Pager Number  
 Hrs of Operations

Randy Owen  
 810-724-6651  
 810-343-1197  
 N/A  
 8 AM to 5 PM

**EXTENDING TO MITN PURCHASING COOPERATIVE**

Y or N

Yes

**PAYMENT TERMS:**

Net 30

**EXCEPTIONS:**

N/A

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: Signed** Y or N

Yes

**PROPOSED PERSONNEL & EQUIPMENT**

**Attached:** Y or N

Yes

**SCHEDULE OF VALUES: Attached** Y or N

Yes



**SCHEDULE OF VALUES  
2010 PROGRAM**

Your company **MUST** complete this form

ITEM	EQUIPMENT DESCRIPTION:	RATES:
<b>Labor - CERTIFIED ARBORIST</b>  Monday - Friday 8 AM to 5 PM		Regular Rate: \$ <u>36.34</u> /Man Hour  Overtime Rate: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour  Holiday Time: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour
<b>Labor - TREE MAN</b>  Monday - Friday 8 AM to 5 PM		Regular Rate: \$ <u>36.34</u> /Man Hour  Overtime Rate: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour  Holiday Time: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour
<b>Labor - STUMP GRINDER OPERATOR</b>  Monday - Friday 8 AM to 5 PM		Regular Rate: \$ <u>36.34</u> /Man Hour  Overtime Rate: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour  Holiday Time: \$ <u>54.51</u> /Man Hour
<b>Labor - Ground Man</b>		Regular Rate: \$ <u>28.03</u> /Man Hour  Overtime Rate: \$ <u>42.05</u> /Man Hour  Holiday Time: \$ <u>42.05</u> /Man Hour
	<b>Logging Truck with Operator</b>	Regular Rate: \$ <u>77.67</u> /Man Hour  Overtime Rate: \$ <u>95.84</u> /Man Hour  Holiday Time: \$ <u>95.84</u> /Man Hour

J.H.WART LRBAV FORESTRY

## SCHEDULE OF VALUES 2010 PROGRAM

Continued

	<b>Front End Loader with Operator</b>	Regular Rate: \$ <u>77.67</u> /Man Hour Overtime Rate: \$ <u>95.84</u> /Man Hour Holiday Time: \$ <u>95.84</u> /Man Hour
	<b>Crane with Operator</b>	Regular Rate: \$ <u>NOT AVAILABLE</u> /Man Hour Overtime Rate: \$ _____ /Man Hour Holiday Time: \$ _____ /Man Hour
	<b>Aerial Tower</b>	\$ <u>13.76</u> /Hour
	<b>Chipper</b>	\$ <u>6.89</u> /Hour
	<b>Dump Truck</b>	\$ <u>6.89</u> /Hour
<b>OTHER:</b>	ARROW BOARD, TRAILER AND PICK-UP, EACH =	\$ <u>6.89</u> /Hour
PLEASE SEE CREW PRICING ↓ EXAMPLES LISTED BELOW		

Hourly Crew Rates	Tree Crews				Brush Chipping	Logging	Stump Grinding	Land Scaping	Stump Grinding
	2-Man	2-Man	3-Man	3-Man	2-Man	1-Man	1-Man	2-Man	3-Man
	Tower Chipper	Tower Dump Chipper	Tower Chipper	Tower Dump Chipper	Dump Chipper	Truck	Dump Stumper	Dump Dump	Dump Dump Stumper
Foreman	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34	\$36.34
Groundman	\$28.03	\$28.03	\$28.03	\$28.03	\$28.03			\$28.03	\$28.03
Groundman			\$28.03	\$28.03					\$28.03
Tower Truck	\$13.76	\$13.76	\$13.76	\$13.76					
Dump Truck		\$6.89		\$6.89	\$6.89		\$6.89	\$6.89	\$6.89
Dump Truck								\$6.89	\$6.89
Chipper	\$6.89	\$6.89	\$6.89	\$6.89	\$6.89				
Stump-Machine							\$41.33		\$41.33
Logging Truck						\$41.33			
Per Hour	\$85.02 <sub>x</sub>	\$91.91	\$113.05	\$119.94 <sub>x</sub>	\$78.15	\$77.67 <sub>x</sub>	\$84.56	\$78.15	\$147.51
Per Hour OTP	\$117.21	\$124.10	\$159.25	\$166.14	\$110.34	\$95.84	\$102.73	\$110.34	\$193.71

Arrow Board	6.89
Pick-Up Truck	6.89
Wood Trailer	6.89