



CITY COUNCIL ACTION REPORT

June 24, 2010

TO: John Szerlag, City Manager

FROM: John M. Lamerato, Assistant City Manager/Finance and Administration
Susan A. Leirstein, Purchasing Director
Cindy Stewart, Community Affairs Director

SUBJECT: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award – Printing of *Troy Today*, Quarterly Newsletter

Background

- On May 24, 2010, Requests for Qualifications/Proposals were received and opened to provide one-year requirements for the Printing of the *Troy Today* newsletter with an option to renew for two additional one-year periods.
- One-Hundred Fifty-One (151) vendors were notified via the Michigan Intergovernmental Trade Network (MITN) website with four (4) proposals received. One vendor was disqualified for not providing the proper proposal surety and two (2) statements of no bids were received.
- All responsive bidders met the pass/fail criteria.
- A committee consisting of Cindy Stewart, Community Affairs Director; Loraine Campbell, Museum Manager; and Elaine Bo, Recreation Supervisor, evaluated the proposals.
- Interviews of the three companies were also conducted.
- Based on the scoring criteria of the proposal, price and interview process, the committee recommends awarding the contract to the highest rated respondent, Grand Blanc Printing Company, Inc. of Grand Blanc, Michigan.

Financial Considerations

- Funds are available in the Community Affairs printing account #101.172.7901; Parks and Recreation Printing account #101.751.752.7901 and the Library Printing account #101.790.7901.
- The total estimated cost for these services has decreased approximately \$35,500.00 over last year in large part due to the reduced weight of the paper, changing from 60# white offset to 35# groundwood, and a reduction in the number of pages for the newsletter.

Legal Considerations

- RFP-COT 10-19 Printing of the *Troy Today*, quarterly newsletter was competitively bid as required by City Charter and Code.
- All bidders were given the opportunity to respond with their level of interest in printing services for the City of Troy.
- Award is contingent upon the recommended bidder's submission of properly executed contract and proposal documents, including insurance certificates and all other specified requirements.

Recommendation

- City management recommends awarding a one-year contract for printing of the *Troy Today*, quarterly newsletter with an option to renew for two additional one-year periods to the highest scoring respondent, Grand Blanc Printing Company, Inc. of Grand Blanc, Michigan, as a result of a best value process for an estimated one year total cost of \$39,008.00 for Proposals A & C, at unit prices contained in the RFP tabulation opened May 24, 2010, with a contract expiration of July 1, 2011.



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

PRINTING OF THE TROY TODAY

STATISTICS:

- ◆ **One hundred fifty-one (151) companies were notified via the MITN e-procurement website**
- ◆ **Four (4) proposals were received. One of the vendors was disqualified for not providing the proper proposal surety and two (2) statements of no bids were received.**
- ◆ **All three (3) companies met the pass/fail criteria**
- ◆ **Grand Blanc Printing Company, Inc. received the highest score as a result of a best value process**

The following three (3) companies received the indicated final scores as a result of the proposal, pricing and interview scores. All three (3) companies participated in an interview.

Company	SCORE
Grand Blanc Printing Co. Inc.	87.6
Grand River Printing & Imaging	86.8
Mignon Communications, Inc.dba Phillips Brothers Printing	69.0

Attachments:

- ✓ Weighted Final Scoring of 100% includes Proposal, Price and Interview
- ✓ Evaluation Process
- ✓ Original Tabulation



WEIGHTED FINAL SCORING
PRINTING OF THE TROY TODAY

Final Score Calculation:

$$\begin{array}{r}
 40\% \text{ Proposal Score (100 point base)} \\
 40\% \text{ Price Score (100 point base)} \\
 20\% \text{ Interview Score (100 point base)} \\
 100\% \hspace{15em} = \text{Final Weighted Score}
 \end{array}$$

In order to equate the price to the weighted evaluation process scoring, the prices had to be converted into a score with the base of 100. **NOTE:** Vendors are listed in the order of their summary score for the proposal and price, from highest to lowest. For the final score the vendors are listed in the order of rating from highest to lowest.

Weighted Average Score for Proposals: 40%

Raters:	1	2	3	Average	Final Weighted Score (x .40)
Vendors:					
Grand Blanc Printing Co. Inc.	92.0	67.0	66.0	75.0	30.0
Grand River Printing & Imaging	96.0	69.0	96.0	87.0	34.8
Mignone Communications, Inc. dba Phillips Brothers Printing	73.0	75.0	77.0	75.0	30.0

Weighted Average Score for Price: 40%

	Weighted Criteria – Difference in Costs [1-(Proposal Price – Lowest Proposal Price) / lowest proposal price] x available points	Final Weighted Score (x .40)
Vendors:		
Grand Blanc Printing Co. Inc.	$(1-(38,608.40-38,608.40)/38,608.40) \times 100 = 100.0$	40.0
Grand River Printing & Imaging	$(1-(45,971.36-38,608.40)/38,608.40) \times 100 = 81$	32.4
Mignone Communications, Inc. dba Phillips Brothers Printing	$(1-(48,380.00-38,608.40)/38,608.40) \times 100 = 74.7$	29.9

Summary: Proposal and Price Scores

	Proposal Score	Price Score	Score
Vendors:			
Grand Blanc Printing Co. Inc.	30.0	40.0	70.0
Grand River Printing & Imaging	34.8	32.4	67.2
Mignone Communications, Inc. dba Phillips Brothers Printing	30.0	29.9	59.9

Weighted Average Score for Interview: 20%

Raters:	1	2	3	Average	Final Weighted Score (x .20)
Vendors:					
Grand Blanc Printing Co. Inc.	92.0	90.0	82.5	88.2	17.6
Grand River Printing & Imaging	100.0	94.5	100.0	98.2	19.6
Mignone Communications, Inc. dba Phillips Brothers Printing	42.0	46.5	47.5	45.3	9.1

Interviews were conducted with all three (3) companies (Maximum # of points – 20)



FINAL SCORE:

VENDORS:	Grand Blanc Printing Co, Inc.	Grand River Printing & Imaging	Mignone Communications, Inc. dba Phillips Brothers Printing
Proposal Score	30.0	34.8	30.0
Price Score	40.0	32.4	29.9
Interview Score	17.6	19.6	9.1
FINAL SCORE	87.6	86.8	69.0

**HIGHEST RATED VENDOR – RECOMMENDED AWARD

G:/ Bid Award 10-11 New Format / Best Value SR8 – RFP – Troy Today Printing – WeightedRatingSummary 6.10.doc



SELECTION PROCESS

CRITERIA FOR SELECTION

An Evaluation Committee will review the proposals. The City of Troy reserves the right to award this proposal to the company considered the most qualified based upon a combination of factors including but not limited to the following:

- A. Compliance with qualifications criteria
- B. Completeness of the proposal
- C. Financial strength and capacity of the company
- D. Correlation of the proposals submitted to the needs of the City of Troy
- E. Any other factors which may be deemed to be in the City's best interest
- F. Evaluation Process

Phase 1: Minimum Qualifications Evaluation

Companies will be required to meet minimum established criteria in order to go to the second phase of the process.

Phase 2: Evaluation of Samples

Each Committee member will independently use a weighted score sheet to evaluate the samples of the "City" type newsletters and paper stock submitted as required. Each Committee Member will calculate a weighted score. The scores of the Committee Members will be averaged into one score for each company for this phase of the process.

Phase 3: Interview Score – (Optional)

The City, at their option, will invite the short-listed companies to participate in an interview. Each Committee Member will independently use a weighted score sheet to evaluate the Interview; each Committee Member will calculate a weighted score. The scores of the Committee Members will be averaged into one score for each company for this phase of the process. Those being interviewed may be supplied with further instructions and requests prior to the interview.

Phase 4: Price

Points for price will be calculated as follows:

FORMULA: $\{1 - (\text{Proposal Price} - \text{Lowest Proposal Price}) / \text{lowest proposal price}\} \times \text{available points (100 base points)}$

Phase 5: Final Scoring and Selection

The company with the highest final weighted score will be recommended to the Troy City Council for Award.

40%	Sample Evaluation Score	(100 point base)
40%	Price Score	(100 point base)
20%	Interview Score	(100 point base) - optional
	100%	

Note: The City of Troy reserves the right to change the order or eliminate an evaluation phase if deemed in the City's best interest to do so.

Opening Date -- 5/24/10
 Date Reviewed - 6/24/10

**CITY OF TROY
 TABULATION
 PRINTING OF TROY TODAY**

VENDOR NAME: sl		Grand Blanc Printing Co Inc	Grand River Printing
CHECK #		31237969	On File
CHECK AMOUNT		\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00

PROPOSAL: FURNISH ALL LABOR, MATERIALS, AND EQUIPMENT TO PROVIDE ONE YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF OFFSET PRINTING AND DELIVERY OF TROY TODAY WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR PERIODS

QTY	DESCRIPTION		
Four (4) Copies of bid proposal	Y or N	Y	Y
Vendor Questionnaire Completed	Y or N	Y	Y
Samples of Newsletters	Y or N	Y	Y

PROPOSAL A: PRINTING OF TROY TODAY

Four Times per Year (144,000 Copies/Year)

BASE BID (glossy cover only)

36,000 Copies per Printing	76 Total Pages	Issue x 4 / Year	\$ 9,652.10	\$ 11,492.84
			\$ 38,608.40	\$ 45,971.36
Paper Manufactured by:	Cover	Sonoma Gloss	Sappi	
	Inside	Electrastar 80	Abitibi Bowater	
Additional Charges:				
1) Cost per each additional 4-page spread				
60 lb Gloss text #3 enamel/gloss			\$810.40 (+ or -)	(+) \$170.38 / (+) \$309.80
35 lb Groundwood			\$306.95 (+ or -)	(+) \$170.38 / (+) \$309.80
2) Changes once proof is produced			\$50.00/Hour	\$80.00/Hour

PROPOSAL B: PRINTING OF TROY TODAY - (Optional)

Four Times per Year (144,000 Copies/Year)

BASE BID (glossy pages cover/inside)

36,000 Copies per Printing	76 Total Pages	Issue x 4 / Year	\$ 14,142.60	\$ 16,791.93
			\$ 56,570.40	\$ 67,167.72
Paper Manufactured by:	Cover	Sonoma Gloss	Sappi	
	Inside	Sonoma Gloss	Abitibi Bowater	
Additional Charges:				
1) Cost per each additional 4-page spread				
60 lb Gloss text #3 enamel/gloss			\$810.40 (+ or -)	(-) \$1,653.73 / (+) \$722.29
40 lb. Gloss			\$455.20 (+ or -)	(-) \$1,653.73 / (+) \$722.29
2) Changes once proof is produced			\$50.00/Hour	\$80.00/Hour

PROPOSAL C: FLIP PAGE NEWSLETTER FOR WEBSITE

Flip Page Newsletter for posting on City's Web

\$100.00/Issue	\$600.00/Issue
----------------	----------------

Completion Schedule:

Can meet 10 BUSINESS DAYS	XX	XX
Cannot meet		

Contact Information

Hours of Operations	M-F 8:30am - 5pm	24/7
24 Hr Phone No.	(810) 694-1155	(734) 394-1400

Payment Terms

2% 10 / Net 30	2% 10 or Net 30
----------------	-----------------

Delivery

10 BUSINESS DAYS

VENDOR NAME:		Grand Blanc Printing Co Inc	Grand River Printing
Exceptions:		Blank	Proposal A & B, 1/2 day of training is included in file preparation and electronic file transmission
Acknowledgement	Signed Y or N	Y	Y
Addendum #1	Attached Y or N	N	N

DISQUALIFIED:

Inco Graphics (did not submit proposal surety check with original documents as specified)

NO BIDS:

ID Enterprises
 Dearborn Lithograph, Inc.

HIGHLIGHTED VENDOR DENOTES BEST VALUE

ATTEST:

Ellen Hodorek
 Diane Fisher
 Julie Hamilton

 Susan Leirstein CPPO CPPB
 Purchasing Director

Opening Date -- 5/24/10
 Date Reviewed - 6/24/10

**CITY OF TROY
 TABULATION
 PRINTING OF TROY TODAY**

VENDOR NAME:

Mignone Communications, Inc
 dba Phillips Brothers Printers

CHECK #

47396

CHECK AMOUNT

\$2,000.00

PROPOSAL: FURNISH ALL LABOR, MATERIALS, AND EQUIPMENT TO PROVIDE ONE YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF OFFSET PRINTING AND DELIVERY OF TROY TODAY WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR PERIODS

QTY	DESCRIPTION		
Four (4) Copies of bid proposal	Y or N	Y	
Vendor Questionnaire Completed	Y or N	Y	
Samples of Newsletters	Y or N	Y	
PROPOSAL A: PRINTING OF TROY TODAY			
Four Times per Year (144,000 Copies/Year)			
BASE BID (glossy cover only)			
36,000 Copies per Printing	76 Total Pages	Issue x 4 / Year	\$ 12,095.00
			\$ 48,380.00
Paper Manufactured by:	Cover Inside	Somerset	
		AbiBow 65 Brite	
Additional Charges:			
1) Cost per each additional 4-page spread			\$1,625.00 (+ or -)
60 lb Gloss text #3 enamel/gloss			(-) \$234.00 / (+) \$405.00
35 lb Groundwood			
2) Changes once proof is produced			\$90.00/Hour
PROPOSAL B: PRINTING OF TROY TODAY - (Optional)			
Four Times per Year (144,000 Copies/Year)			
BASE BID (glossy pages cover/inside)			
36,000 Copies per Printing	76 Total Pages	Issue x 4 / Year	\$ 15,445.00
			\$ 61,780.00
Paper Manufactured by:	Cover Inside	Somerset	
		AbiBow Gloss 76	
Additional Charges:			
1) Cost per each additional 4-page spread			\$1,625.00 (+ or -)
60 lb Gloss text #3 enamel/gloss			(-) \$400.00 / (+) \$575.00
40 lb. Gloss			
2) Changes once proof is produced			\$90.00/Hour
PROPOSAL C: FLIP PAGE NEWSLETTER FOR WEBSITE			
Flip Page Newsletter for posting on City's Web		No Bid	
Completion Schedule:			
Can meet	10 BUSINESS DAYS	XX	
Cannot meet			
Contact Information			
Hours of Operations		24Hrs-3 pressroom/2 bindery shifts	
24 Hr Phone No.		(260) 358-0266	
Payment Terms			
		Net 30	
Delivery			
10 BUSINESS DAYS			

Opening Date -- 5/24/10
Date Reviewed - 6/24/10

**CITY OF TROY
TABULATION
PRINTING OF TROY TODAY**

VENDOR NAME:		Mignone Communications, Inc dba Phillips Brothers Printers	
Exceptions:		Blank	
Acknowledgement	Signed Y or N	Y	
Addendum #1	Attached Y or N	Y	