The Special/Study Meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Strat at 7:30 p.m. on April 26, 2005 in the Council Board Room of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:
Gary Chamberlain
Lynn Drake-Batts
Fazal Khan
Lawrence Littman
Robert Schultz
Thomas Strat
Mark J. Vleck
David T. Waller

Absent:
Wayne Wright

Also Present:
Mark F. Miller, Planning Director
Brent Savidant, Principal Planner
Allan Motzny, Assistant City Attorney
Richard K. Carlisle, Carlisle/Wortman Associates
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

Resolution # PC-2005-04-058
Moved by: Schultz
Seconded by: Littman

RESOLVED, That Member Wright is excused from attendance at this meeting for personal reasons.

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Wright

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Miller announced the Agenda was revised and updated copies have been provided to the members.

2. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There was no one present who wished to speak.

3. PLANNING AND ZONING REPORT

Mr. Miller reported on Council actions taken at its April 18, 2005 Regular Meeting.

- Preliminary Site Condominium Review, Oak Forest Site Condominium, south side of Square Lake Road, between Willow Grove and John R Road, Section 11 – R-1C - ***Approved***
- Preliminary Site Condominium Review, Oak Forest South Site Condominium, east side of Willow Grove, south of Square Lake Road, Section 11 – R-1C - ***Approved***

Mr. Miller announced that the May 10, 2005 Planning Commission Regular Meeting agenda is very heavy.

4. DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY REPORT

Mr. Miller reported on the April 20, 2005 Downtown Development Authority (DDA) meeting.

- Contract for the Big Beaver Corridor Study to Birchler Arroyo Associates – ***Approved*** *(Note: Item will go forward to City Council for review/approval at its May 9, 2005 Regular Meeting)*
- DDA Budget - ***Approved***

5. BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS REPORT

Mr. Motzny reported on the April 19, 2005 Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) meeting.

- Variance Requests (3) - ***Approved***
- Interpretation Request, George Reed, Betty Reed and Thomas Krent, 3129 Alpine, appealing the issuance of a building permit to construct a garage at 3129 Alpine – ***Motion to support Building Department's interpretation of the Zoning Ordinance failed by a 4-3 vote***

TABLED AND POSTPONED ITEMS

6. SITE PLAN REVIEW (SP 323-B) – Proposed Restaurant Addition, Northeast corner of Big Beaver and Crooks (888 W. Big Beaver), Section 21, Zoned O-S-C (Office Service Commercial) District

Mr. Miller reviewed the conditions for which the proposed restaurant addition was tabled at the April 12, 2005 Regular Meeting. Mr. Miller reported that the petitioner has submitted an updated set of plans showing the proposed parking layout and provided additional landscaping on the parcel. Mr. Miller said it is the recommendation of the Planning Department to approve the site plan as submitted with three conditions: (1) Add a 5-foot wide sidewalk on the west side of Wilshire; (2) Provide one tree for each 30 linear foot of frontage along Big Beaver, Crooks

and Wilshire; and (3) Clarify the height and species of the hedges and trees proposed for the corners of Crooks/Big Beaver and Wilshire/Big Beaver.

Mr. Savidant reviewed the proposed Resolution A that would provide 145 landbanked parking spaces and a parking reduction of 19 spaces and proposed Resolution B that would provide 174 landbanked parking spaces.

David Richards, Architect, Rossetti and Associates, Two Towne Square, Southfield, was present to represent the petitioner. Mr. Richards displayed the two sets of plans for the parking and provided a brief explanation of the revisions to the landscape plan. Mr. Richards indicated that the petitioner would be in favor of a Resolution that would provide a reduction in 19 parking spaces.

The following items were addressed with the petitioner:

- Sidewalk along Wilshire.
- Storm water runoff.
- Permanent greenbelt between Big Beaver right-of-way and off-street parking.
- Rooftop screening of mechanical equipment.
- Snow removal.
- Landscape Plan with respect to 29 ward's yews in each corner, tree count discrepancy between plan and site visit, clustering of trees, shrubbery in lieu of trees.
- Signage for handicapped parking.
- Visibility of parked trucks on site.
- Reduction of 19 parking spaces.

Resolution # PC-2005-04-059
Moved by: Schultz
Seconded by: Khan

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission hereby approves the landbanking of 145 spaces in the parking deck. This reduction meets the standards of Article 40.20.13 and will assist Redico and Morton's Restaurant in minimizing the amount of storm water runoff on the site.

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission hereby approves a reduction in the total number of required parking spaces of 19 spaces. This reduction meets the standards of Article 40.20.12 and will allow Redico and Morton's Restaurant to minimize the amount of storm water runoff on the site and maintain a permanent greenbelt between the Big Beaver right-of-way and the proposed off-street parking area.

RESOLVED, The 145 landbanked spaces and the 19 space reduction will reduce the number of required parking spaces on site by 164 spaces, to 1,245 spaces, when 1,245 spaces are required based on the off-street parking space requirements for restaurants and office uses, as per Article XL.

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission has made a determination that the applicant has met the standard of Section 26.25.01 of the Zoning Ordinance, which requires that restaurants in the O-S-C be permitted "provided they are included in the office use structure or other principal structures…or are attached to such structures by means of a fully enclosed structural attachment, and therefore shall not be permitted as free-standing structures. Such secondary structures shall be designed so as to provide a logical extension of the floor plan of the principal structures, and shall utilize exterior materials similar to or harmonious with such principal structures".

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, as requested for the Proposed Restaurant Addition, located on the northeast corner of Big Beaver and Crooks, located in Section 21, within the O-S-C zoning district, is hereby granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. Add a 5-foot wide sidewalk on the west side of Wilshire, from the entry drive north to the end of the existing sidewalk.
2. Provide one tree for each 30 linear feet of frontage along Big Beaver, Crooks and Wilshire, as per Article 39.70.02.
3. Provide 29 ward's yews planted in a hedge and one (1) tree at each corner of Big Beaver/Crooks and Big Beaver/Wilshire, as indicated on Sheet A100.
4. All roof-mounted mechanicals shall be appropriately screened with a similar material to the exterior of the principal structure.
5. That there shall be two (2) handicapped parking spaces near the entrance to the Melting Pot Restaurant where the site plan currently indicates only one (1).

Yes: All present (8)
No: None
Absent: Wright

MOTION CARRIED

7. PROPOSED PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT (PUD 5) – Maple Forest Crossing – East side of Rochester Road, South of South Boulevard, R-1D, B-3 and P-1, Section 2

Mr. Miller provided a brief review of the proposed PUD and introduced Joe Paluzzi, Gary Abitheira, and Brad Byarski, representatives of Michigan Home Builders. Mr. Miller said the intent of the presentation is to provide the petitioner an opportunity to present their conceptual plan and receive feedback and direction from the members.

Mr. Carlisle commented on the exterior features of the location. He said conceptually it is a good use of a PUD because of the need for flexibility to accommodate the exterior factors. Mr. Carlisle said the project has the most mixed uses than any other project that has come before the Planning Commission. Mr. Carlisle said the transition between the frontage property and the proposed residential was discussed at great length with the petitioners. He addressed the proposed building elevations, orientation of garage doors and green space.

Mr. Paluzzi addressed the environmental design techniques; i.e., retention pond, water discharge.

Mr. Byarski gave a brief presentation of the conceptual plan with the use of visual boards. He provided a brief history of the conception of the project. Mr. Byarski reported that 95% of property ownership is theirs. It is their intention to get feedback and favorable approval of the conceptual plan and to move forward with the project.

It was a general consensus of the members that the proposed PUD is a well-conceived conceptual plan for the location. Items addressed were:

- Density
- Green space
- Parking layout/design; i.e., shared parking bank/banquet facility, parallel, guest
- Garage door orientation/design
- Entrance to project as relates to traffic in general area
- Sidewalks; i.e., width, location
- Construction entrance
- PUD vs development achieved through rezonings
- Building material

Mr. Smith spoke favorably of the conceptual plan with respect to the responsiveness of the petitioners and the good integration of mixed uses. He said the PUD is a powerful tool that would make the proposed plan a financially feasible product. Mr. Smith complimented the petitioners on the plan.

Chair Strat requested a recess at 8:55 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 9:05 p.m.

---

8. PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT (PUD 4) – Proposed The Monarch Private Residences, 209 units, 11,166 S.F. retail space and structured parking, North side of Big Beaver Road between Alpine and McClure, Section 20 – O-1 (Low Rise Office), P-1 (Vehicular Parking) and R-1B (One Family Residential Districts

Mr. Miller said the purpose of tonight's meeting is to discuss: (1) public benefit; (2) the buffer area between the townhouses and the existing single family residential; and (3) the relationship of the townhouses to single family residential. Mr. Miller briefly addressed the landscape plan, communication from the petitioner with respect to public benefit, and the history and evolution of the project.

Mr. Carlisle briefly addressed the evolution of the design layout in relation to the transition to single family residential.

Jennifer Mooney, Bob Dudick, Tom Kafkes and John Bender of Joseph Freed and Associates were present. Also present were Gary Jonna of Whitehall Real Estate and Ron Phillips of Tadian Homes. Ms. Mooney introduced the Landscape Architect Randy Metz of Grissim Metz Andriese Associates and Architect David Donnellon of Design Resources.

Design Layout / Transition Buffer

Mr. Metz presented in detail the significant features of the overall plan inclusive of the landscaping and introduced the lighting plan, with the use of various visual aids.

Discussion followed. Comments were taken from around the table.

Public Benefit

Ms. Mooney addressed the following public benefits:

(1) $1.9 million expected tax revenue annually
(2) Enhancement to Big Beaver corridor; i.e., pedestrian traffic, retailers, restaurants, etc., that will generate sales and additional tax revenue
(3) Off-site landscaping and lighting program along Alpine and McClure
(4) Off site landscape in front of DADA parking lot and auto dealership
(5) Pocket parks
(6) New product line to the market
(7) Underground detention
(8) Parking structure
(9) Improvement to pedestrian friendly environment

Ms. Mooney asked the City to consider the merits of an additional public benefit -- a "Neighborhood Improvement Fund" – in which a contribution would be made to fund a specific area chosen by the neighborhood; i.e., streetscape enhancement, landscape enhancement, neighborhood park, etc.

Mr. Carlisle suggested that the contribution be earmarked for specific purposes.

Discussion followed. Comments were taken from around the table.

Ms. Mooney summarized the meeting with the Road Commission for Oakland County and the City's Traffic Engineer with respect to a pedestrian crosswalk across Big Beaver Road.

Mr. Chamberlain commented on the presentation given by the Road Commission for Oakland County (RCOC) at the April 20, 2005 Downtown Development Authority (DDA) meeting, and the DDA's resolution in support of the funding needs for the County road infrastructure.

Chair Strat requested a recess at 10:35 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 10:40 p.m.

Layout/Design of The Villas (Townhouses)

Comments were taken from around the table.

By a show of hands, the majority of members agreed that the petitioner should further address the following items:

- Snow removal
- Distance to walk from guest parking to the most northerly units
- Parking (emergency vehicle access; distance between units)
- Preliminary conceptual drainage plan
- Preliminary conceptual grading plan

By a show of hands, a majority vote was not reached on the following items:

- Reduction in density
- 16-foot setback along Alpine and McClure

Mr. Miller requested the petitioner to provide complete updated booklets and full size prints in a timely manner for review by staff, the Planning Consultant and the Planning Commission.

Ms. Mooney stated their objective for requesting a Public Hearing at the May 10, 2005 Regular Meeting.

9. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mike Baxter of 3141 McClure, Troy, was present to speak on The Monarch PUD. Mr. Baxter is an adjoining property owner to the project. He spoke at a previous meeting in which concerns relating to privacy, setbacks and density were voiced. Mr. Baxter said written communication in which those concerns were detailed was sent to the Planning Commission members and developer, and he would like to confirm that the communication was received and that the concerns are on record.

GOOD OF THE ORDER

Mr. Miller confirmed that all public comment relating to the The Monarch project would be attached and made a part of the Planning Department report.

Mr. Waller said the members have a right to ask a petitioner to consider making changes, but the petitioner has a right to not accept those suggestions.

Mr. Vleck agreed with Mr. Waller's comments. He addressed Mr. Chamberlain's comments relating to the Road Commission's request for support from the DDA on RCOC projects.

Mr. Khan agreed that a petitioner has the right to do what he wants, but he as a commissioner has the right to not vote for a project should he not like it.

Mr. Chamberlain suggested that the members watch the presentation given by the Road Commission at the Downtown Development Authority meeting. He said the formal presentation was approximately 45 minutes and a variety of taxes and specific amounts of money were discussed.

Mr. Motzny invited everyone to join the Legal Department for Law Day on Wednesday, May 4. The official theme for this year's Law Day is "The American Jury; We the People in Action".

Mr. Carlisle addressed The Monarch project. He said that 99% of the comments made by the members involve approximately 10% of the project. He hopes all the project team members heard the comments and suggestions of the Planning Commission.

Mr. Miller said consideration was given to having the Road Commission give the same presentation to the Planning Commission as it did to the DDA on April 20, 2005.

Mr. Schultz asked if the Road Commission recognized the millions of dollars that the City of Troy has already contributed to the expansion of Big Beaver Road.

ADJOURN

The Special/Study Meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 11:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

_____

Thomas Strat, Chair

_____

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\Planning Commission Minutes\2005 PC Minutes\Draft\04-26-05 Special Study Meeting_Draft.doc