

Chair Faison called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:02 p.m. on February 12, 2019 in the Council Chambers of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Ollie Apahidean  
 Karen Crusse  
 Carlton M. Faison  
 Barbara Fowler  
 Michael W. Hutson  
 Sadek Rahman  
 John J. Tagle

Absent:

Tom Krent

Also Present:

R. Brent Savidant, Planning Director  
 Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates  
 Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney  
 Hemanth Tadepalli, Student Representative  
 Jackie Ferencz, Planning Department Administrative Assistant  
 Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Savidant corrected the agenda to read Agenda item #6 as a Public Hearing and File Number SP JPLN2019-0002 and Agenda item #7 as a Public Hearing and File Number SP JPLN2019-0001.

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-009**

Moved by: Tagle  
 Support by: Crusse

**RESOLVED**, To approve the Agenda as amended.

Yes: All present (7)  
 Absent: Krent

**MOTION CARRIED**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-010**

Moved by: Rahman  
 Support by: Apahidean

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of the January 22, 2019 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (7)  
Absent: Krent

### **MOTION CARRIED**

#### 4. PUBLIC COMMENT – Items not on the Agenda

There was no one present to speak.

### **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEWS**

#### 5. PUBLIC HEARING - PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2018-0013) – Proposed West Troy Meadows, North of Wattles, West of Livernois (Parcel 88-20-16-401-002), Section 16, Currently Zoned R-1B (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the changes of the Preliminary Site Plan application since last reviewed by the Planning Commission at their July 10, 2018 meeting. He addressed the comparison between the parallel plan versus the proposed cluster development option. Mr. Carlisle said the concerns expressed at the July meeting were related to access and traffic. The revised plan does not include a roadway extension to Virgilia Drive but rather the right-of-way is used for a pedestrian connection to the residential areas to the south. Mr. Carlisle indicated the City's traffic engineering consultant OHM concurs with the findings of the traffic study and recommends approval of the application with minor site plan revisions cited in their memorandum dated December 12, 2018.

Mr. Carlisle recommended Preliminary Site Plan approval with the conditions as identified in his report dated February 3, 2019.

Sara Merrill of OHM gave a brief review of how the findings of the traffic study were achieved.

Joseph Maniaci of Mondrian Properties said the revised plan addresses concerns of the neighboring residents with respect to lot size and traffic. He addressed elevation options and confirmed that all elevation options would fit on any lot.

There was discussion on:

- Housing options.
- Parallel plan versus cluster development option.
- Traffic findings.

Chair Faison opened the Public Hearing.

- Barry Johnson, 2835 E Square Lake; addressed animal corridors.
- Marcia Bossenberger, 369 Ottawa; addressed traffic study, concerns with teenagers getting to school.

- Dan Geisner, 4402 Hedgewood; addressed concerns with existing wildlife, construction, traffic, disappearing green space.
- Debra Hagelstein, 224 Webb; addressed concerns with access, construction; asked status of proposed vacation of Virgilia.
- Brad Samojedny, 139 Webb; addressed concerns with big-foot housing, City easement, traffic.

Chair Faison closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Carlisle said the proposed street vacation was eliminated from the revised plan. He explained the right-of-way will extend and connect to Paragon and a pedestrian path is proposed.

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-011**

Moved by: Tagle

Support by: Hutson

**RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission hereby recommends to the City Council that the proposed West Troy Meadows Site Condominium, 35 units/lots, North of Wattles, West of Livernois (Parcel 88-20-16-401-002), Section 16, approximately 19.86 acres in size, Currently Zoned R-1B (One Family Residential) District, be approved for the following reasons:

1. The request complies with the Master Plan. The site is designated as Recreation and Open Space in the Master Plan. It was designated as such because it was school-owned plus the presence of a MDEQ regulated wetland. The applicant proposes to preserve over 5 acres of the 6.14 acres of wetland. In addition, the applicant proposes to preserve 42% site open space and preserve 561 trees (8,057 inches). If this site were to be developed for a use other than a park/open space, a cluster development to preserve open space, protected trees, and the regulated wetland is the most consistent form of development to the Master Plan. The applicant is better able to preserve natural features and provide common open space via rezoning the property and developing the site as a cluster.
2. The cluster development better protects the sites natural resources than if the site were to be developed as a cluster.
3. The cluster development better protects the adjacent properties than if the site were not developed as a cluster.
4. The cluster development is compatible with adjacent properties.
5. The site can be adequately served with municipal water and sewer.

**BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission recommends the following design considerations:

1. Address OHMs site plan comments from December 12, 2018 memo.
2. Submission of open space preservation covenant.
3. Submission of a detailed narrative that indicates a specific method for protecting significant natural features including tree preservation and wetland preservation.

Yes: All present (7)  
 Absent: Krent

**MOTION CARRIED**

Ms. Crusse addressed the cluster development option with respect to preservation of green space.

6. PUBLIC HEARING - PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2019-0002) – Proposed Preserves of Troy, North side of Square Lake between John R and Dequindre (Parcels 88-20-01-451-001 and 88-20-01-300-016), Section 1, Currently Zoned R-1D (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Carlisle gave a report on the Preliminary Site Plan application. He addressed the donation of 75 acres to the Six Rivers Land Conservancy and an endowment of \$150,000. Mr. Carlisle said the applicant does not meet the perimeter setback for lots 3 through 9 and lot 11, for which the Planning Commission can make a recommendation to accept the setback deviation. He addressed the parallel plan versus the proposed cluster development option, OHM’s review of traffic, site access and circulation, landscape preservation and elevations.

Mr. Carlisle recommended approval of the cluster development with the perimeter setback deviation for lots 3 through 9 and lot 11 and with the conditions as identified in his report dated February 5, 2019.

Joseph Maniaci of Mondrian Properties addressed the joint relationship with the Troy School District for the property acquisition. He said the purpose of relief of the perimeter setback requirement is to preserve additional land for those lots that back up to the nature preserve.

Chris Bunch, Executive Director of Six Rivers Land Conservancy, handed out an informative flyer about the Conservancy and gave a brief introduction of the Conservancy. He said the donation of land would not be run like a park but would be a quiet recreational nature preserve in perpetuity, and accessible and usable by the public.

There was discussion on:

- \$150,000 endowment; seed dollars to start, fund growth with investment and long-term management, minimal improvements.
- Parking lot; location, number of spaces, use of Evanswood Church lot for overflow.
- Access for homeowners; no formal connection but steps from their back doors.
- Access from Evanswood Church; easement, sale of church property.

Chair Faison opened the Public Hearing.

Mary Bogush, 1418 Ottawa, Royal Oak; addressed the nature preserves use for educational purposes, circulated pictures of boardwalk donated by photographer James Baker, addressed dismay in losing nature preserves.

Barry Johnson, 2835 E. Square Lake Road; addressed animal corridors, tree inventory, clear cutting of property.

Darrol Colberg, 2473 E. Square Lake; addressed location of parking lot, potential water problems.

Robert Sheridan, 2379 Topaz; addressed passing lanes for traffic, concerns with vehicular headlights shining onto his property.

Chair Faison closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Savidant said a tree inventory was completed only on the 6 acres to be developed. He indicated a tree inventory is not required for the remaining 75 acres because it will remain untouched. He assured there will be no clear cutting of the property. Mr. Savidant noted the 75 acres connects to the Sanctuary Lake Golf Course to the north and property considered as wetlands and trees to the northwest, therefore there would be little or no disruption to the 75 acres with respect to animal corridors.

Mr. Savidant asked Sara Merrill of OHM if a 23-unit site condominium with a small parking lot and two points of ingress/egress would warrant deceleration lanes.

Ms. Merrill said that concern was posed to the City Engineer and developer. She stated a right turn deceleration lane has been requested at the westerly driveway.

John Thompson of Professional Engineers Associates (PEA) said the gravel parking lot location does have a large grade drop down into a water course but it is still in the highland. He said an alternate location for the parking lot could be looked into with potentially less of an impact.

Ms. Dufrane asked the applicant to have the Agreement among the parties complete prior to presenting the application to City Council for consideration.

Mr. Maniaci said he would work with the resident who spoke at the Public Hearing to assure shielding of vehicular headlights.

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-012**

Moved by: Hutson  
 Support by: Apahidean

**RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission hereby recommends to the City Council that the proposed Preserves of Troy Site Condominium, 23 units/lots, North side of Square Lake, between John R and Dequindre (Parcel 88-20-01-451-001 and 88-20-01-300-016), Section 1, approximately 81.1 acres in size, Currently Zoned R-1D (One Family Residential) District, be approved for the following reasons:

1. The request complies with the Master Plan.
2. The cluster development better protects the site’s natural resources than if the site were not developed as a cluster.
3. The cluster development better protects the adjacent properties than if the site were not developed as a cluster.
4. The development provides for the protection of 75 acres of open space in perpetuity.
5. The cluster development is compatible with adjacent properties.
6. The site can be adequately served with municipal water and sewer.

**BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission recommends the following design considerations:

1. Provide city with confirmation of donation of +/- 75 acres to Six Rivers Land Conservatory.
2. Update turnaround north of lot 12 based upon City Engineer review.

Yes: All present (7)  
 Absent: Krent

**MOTION CARRIED**

7. **PUBLIC HEARING - PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2019-0001)** – Proposed Chadbury Place, South of Long Lake, between John R and Dequindre (Parcel 88-20-13-127-020), Section 13, Currently Zoned R-1C (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Preliminary Site Plan application. He addressed the parallel plan versus the proposed cluster development option, the existing pond, OHM memorandum as relates to traffic impact, landscaping and the applicant’s request to waive the perimeter setback requirement for Unit 5.

Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission to consider the proposed development and if the layout and open space plans meets the intent and standards of the cluster provision. Mr. Carlisle read the text relating to the intent of the cluster option and the cluster standards set forth in Section 10.04.I of the Zoning Ordinance.

Joseph Maniaci of Mondrian Properties addressed the buffer proposed on three sides of the development. He said a neighborhood meeting was held and residents expressed a desire for a berm along the southern property line.

John Thompson of Professional Engineering Associates (PEA) addressed stormwater management and the existing pond. He said after an extensive research it is determined the pond is not spring-fed and was created for irrigation purposes.

There was discussion on:

- Pond; spring-fed or not.
- Internal access/circulation; specifically in relation to Lot 9.
- Berm/landscaping buffer -vs- new homes backing up to existing homes.
- Preservation of green space; passive versus amenity such as a park.
- Cluster option as relates to building envelope, maintenance of green space.

Chair Faison opened the Public Hearing.

Chris Middleton, 2349 Avery; addressed concerns of the pond, wildlife, size of homes.

Alexander Brideau, 2391 Avery; addressed concerns of the pond, potential flooding, wildlife and construction noise.

George Salem, 2363 Avery; addressed height of berm, concerns with shielding of headlights.

Richard Stanichuk, 4991 Foxcroft; addressed difference of site layout from presentation at neighborhood meeting, concerns with privacy as relates to height differences in elevations.

Marcia Bossenberger, 369 Ottawa; addressed parallel plan versus cluster; consideration by applicant to develop 14 homes under cluster option.

Chair Faison closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Savidant clarified the site layout presented this evening is a mirror image of the site layout initially submitted and presented at the neighborhood meeting. The layout was “flip-flopped” because of the location of access drives on the north and south sides of Long Lake.

Mr. Savidant said he would work with the applicant and the project engineer to gather additional information on the pond so concerns of the neighbors can be assured at the time the application is considered by City Council.

Mr. Thompson said the height of the berm would be determined at the time of final engineering but the goal would be three feet high and supplemented by additional landscaping.

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-013**

Moved by: Fowler  
 Support by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission hereby recommends to the City Council that the proposed Chadbury Place Site Condominium, 16 units/lots, South of Long Lake, between John R and Dequindre (Parcel 88-20-13-127-020), Section 13, approximately 5.22 acres in size, Currently Zoned R-1C (One Family Residential) District, be approved for the following reasons:

1. The request complies with the Master Plan.
2. The cluster development better protects the adjacent properties than if the site were not developed as a cluster.
3. The cluster development is compatible with adjacent properties.
4. The site can be adequately served with municipal water and sewer.

**BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED**, The Planning Commission recommends the following design considerations:

1. Information regarding the pond be provided to City Council in writing by the applicant.
2. Submission of open space preservation covenant.
3. Submission of a detailed narrative that indicates a specific method for protecting significant natural features including tree preservation and wetland preservation.

Yes: All present (7)  
 Absent: Krent

**MOTION CARRIED**

Chair Faison break at 9:21 p.m.; meeting reconvened at 9:29 p.m.

**SPECIAL USE APPROVAL**

8. **SPECIAL USE AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2018-0007)** – Proposed Holiday Inn Hotel, East of Crooks Road, North side of Tower (900 Tower), Section 9, Currently Zoned OM (Office Mixed Use) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use and Preliminary Site Plan application since last considered by the Planning Commission at their August 28, 2018 meeting. He reported the applicant reduced the number of hotels from two to one and shifted the Holiday Inn hotel to the southeast location. Mr. Carlisle addressed the proposed shared parking and OHM review of the shared parking. He asked the Board’s consideration of the proposed architecture of the hotel based upon materials provided and the applicant’s explanation of the building design. Mr. Carlisle recommended approval of the Special Use and Preliminary Site Plan application with conditions as identified in report dated February 6, 2019.

Present were Asad Malik, President and CEO of Amerilodge Group, project architect Toufik Bentahar and Tony Antone of Kojaiian Companies.

Mr. Antone said the shared parking arrangement would be in perpetuity with no fees. He said the current occupancy rate of the Tower office building is 60%.

Mr. Bentahar addressed the proposed hotel architecture as relates to the standard corporate design, materials and colors. Sample building materials were circulated.

There was discussion on:

- Shared parking agreement; terms, in perpetuity.
- Parking study as relates to changes in use; require review by administration.
- Current vacancy rate of office building.
- Hotel elevation; lack of creativity especially rear elevation.
- Market served/demand of hotel.

Mr. Bentahar said he would work with the Planning Department and corporate offices of Holiday Inn regarding improvements to the building design, such as color variations in building materials.

Sara Merrill of OHM gave a brief review on how the findings of the parking study were achieved, noting building occupancy does not play a role.

Chair Faison opened the floor for public comment.

Greg Kroesing, Director of Sales and Marketing at Embassy Suites, 850 Tower; addressed parking study statistics as relates to hotel employees, ballroom, meeting room and banquet facility, does not believe there is adequate parking on site.

Ariana Pellegrino of Dickinson Wright PLLC, 2600 W. Big Beaver, on behalf of Embassy Suites; addressed parking as relates to Section 9.03 of the Zoning Ordinance, specifically standards 1, 3 and 5; concerns of overflow parking from proposed hotel to Embassy Suites; impact of the shared internal access roads.

Chair Faison closed the floor for public comment.

Sara Merrill of OHM addressed the parking study as relates to employee count, impact of banquet facility and events. She indicated the parking study complies with the shared parking agreement.

**Resolution # PC-2019-02-014**

Moved by: Tagle

Support by: Hutson

**RESOLVED**, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Articles 8 and 9 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Holiday Inn Hotel, East of Crooks, North side of Tower (900 Tower), Section 9, Currently Zoned OM

(Office Mixed Use) District, be postponed, to allow the applicant to redesign or look at design options for the façade of the building.

Yes: All present (7)

Absent: Krent

**MOTION CARRIED**

**OTHER BUSINESS**

9. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – Items on Current Agenda

There was no one present to speak.

10. **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

There were general Planning Commission comments.

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 10:23 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Carlton Faison, Chair

---

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

C:\Users\bob\Documents\Kathy\COT Planning Commission Minutes\2019\2019 02 12 Regular Meeting\_Draft.doc