

Chair Faison called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:02 p.m. on March 12, 2019 in the Council Chambers of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Karen Crusse  
Carlton M. Faison  
Barbara Fowler  
Michael W. Hutson  
Tom Krent  
Sadek Rahman

Absent:

Ollie Apahidean  
David Lambert  
John J. Tagle

Also Present:

R. Brent Savidant, Planning Director  
Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates  
Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney  
Hemanth Tadepalli, Student Representative  
Jackie Ferencz, Planning Department Administrative Assistant  
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Resolution # PC-2019-03-019**

Moved by: Fowler  
Support by: Hutson

**RESOLVED**, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (6)  
Absent: Apahidean, Lambert, Tagle

**MOTION CARRIED**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**Resolution # PC-2019-03-020**

Moved by: Krent  
Support by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of the February 26, 2019 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (6)  
Absent: Apahidean, Lambert, Tagle

### **MOTION CARRIED**

#### 4. PUBLIC COMMENT – Items not on the Agenda

Thomas Pakula, 6771 Locust, addressed the Zoning Ordinance and City Code as relates to parked vehicles on lawns.

Mr. Savidant acknowledged Mr. Pakula’s concern and said an effective way to address it might be to initiate a standalone ordinance or property maintenance enforcement code separate from the Zoning Ordinance.

### **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW**

#### 5. PUBLIC HEARING – CONDITIONAL REZONING (File Number CR JPLN2018-004) – Proposed BGB Luxury Apartments, West side of John R, North of Big Beaver (1819-1929 E Big Beaver and 3125 John R), Section 23, From MF (Multiple Family) Zoning District to UR (Urban Residential) Zoning District

Mr. Carlisle outlined the procedure for a Conditional Rezoning application. He gave a review on the Conditional Rezoning application, noting the Planning Commission reviewed a conceptual plan about one year ago that included approximately 4 acres of the San Marino Club property, which has since been removed from the application.

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Conditional Rezoning Standards for consideration by the Planning Commission. He addressed “by right” development versus the proposed Conditional Rezoning, transitional buffer for adjacent single family residential, site arrangement specifically in relation to open space and the relationship of Building 1 to John R, traffic study review by the City’s Traffic Consultant OHM and site circulation.

Mr. Carlisle recommended the Planning Commission give consideration to:

- Transitional buffer and screening to the adjacent single family residential.
- Perspective view from single family residential.
- Installation of berm and evergreen trees along north property line prior to construction.
- Reducing height of Buildings 1 through 4 from three to two stories.
- Additional common open space.
- Traffic impacts with and without traffic signal on Nancy Bostick Drive and John R.

Further, Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission to give consideration to any public comments this evening and to additional summary items as identified in his report dated March 5, 2019.

Stephen Dearing of OHM Advisors addressed the traffic study prepared by GHD as relates to traffic circulation and pattern. He indicated the report did not focus on the parking lot of the sports center complex.

Present were property owner Dennis Bostick, project architect Mark Abanatha of Alexander V. Bogaerts & Associates and Traffic Consultant Matt Kolis of GHD.

Mr. Bostick addressed the proposed luxury apartments with respect to the high quality of management and maintenance that will be offered. He stated the number of units do not relate to the size of the property and indicated consideration was given to reducing the number of units.

Mr. Abanatha addressed the transition from commercial to single family residential, building heights and massing, building materials and architectural features, water feature and pond at entrance, visual sight line between apartments and adjacent single family residential, neighborhood meeting, and concerns identified in the Planning Consultant report. Mr. Abanatha displayed several renderings.

Mr. Kolis addressed the traffic study and specific concerns of Raintree Village Homeowners Association. He said there is no recommendation for a traffic signal to be installed at Nancy Bostick Drive and further discussion with OHM determined no mitigation is required at that intersection. Mr. Kolis said the road north of Nancy Bostick Drive was not included in the study. He said the project intersections for the study were determined by OHM, and OHM determined traffic impact on the road north of Nancy Bostick Drive is estimated at 10%.

There was discussion on:

- Urban Residential (UR) zoning districts in the City.
- Proposed development as relates to Big Beaver Corridor Study, Building Height Plan and Master Plan.
- Density comparison of Urban Residential and Multi-Family zoning districts.
- Proposed development in comparison to existing development at southwest corner of Square Lake and Livernois (Tisbury Square).
- Comparison of application with conceptual plan that included additional 4 acres.

Chair Faison opened the Public Hearing.

- Craig Chamberlain, President of Raintree Village Homeowners Association, addressed the traffic impact study in relation to existing developments, developments under construction, site access and existing traffic. He said the purpose of the study and good planning would be to include the impact of a traffic signal at Nancy Bostick Drive in the scope of the traffic impact study. Mr. Chamberlain also referenced justification in Resolution #4 that the developer will not unreasonably impact surrounding traffic.

- Jeff Frederick, 1792 Crestline, spoke in opposition; addressed concerns with density, traffic, site access through retail parking lot, safety of pedestrians and school children, impact on schools.
- Jodi Fisher, 2221 Traverse, spoke in opposition; addressed concerns with safety, traffic, density, lack of common area, impact on schools, conducted online survey.
- Frederick Przybysz, 3842 Wayfarer, spoke in opposition; addressed vision of Troy, building height, visual sight line.
- Alex August, 2221 Traverse, spoke in opposition; addressed urban residential versus multi family zoning districts, traffic circulation and pattern, traffic signal.
- Marcia Bossenberger, 369 Ottawa; addressed traffic through retail center, future of San Marino Club property, common area, school bus stop, trash compactor/collection.

Chair Faison closed the Public Hearing.

There was discussion on:

- Similarity of proposed development to Tisbury Square development.
- Density and building heights.
- Impact on Troy School District; location of school bus stop.
- Suitability of Urban Residential versus Multi-Family.
- Traffic impact; circulation and access.
- Common area; amenities.
- Commendation to project architect for architectural features and design.
- Trash compactor location; pickup/collection details.
- Number of garages and carports in relation to apartment dwellers.

Mr. Abanatha asked that the application be tabled so comments from the public and Planning Commission can be taken into consideration and come back before the Board.

**Resolution # PC-2019-03-021**

Moved by: Krent  
 Support by: Hutson

**RESOLVED**, That the Planning Commission hereby postpones this item for the following reason(s):

1. Give the applicant an opportunity to work out some details as relates to site access, traffic circulation and pattern through the retail parking lot, impact on schools and bus routes, density as relates to units per acre, details on trash and recycling collection, heights of all the buildings, open space and vehicular turnaround.

Yes: All present (6)  
 Absent: Apahidean, Lambert, Tagle

**MOTION CARRIED**

## **SPECIAL USE APPROVAL**

6. **PUBLIC HEARING - SPECIAL USE AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2018-0025)** – Proposed Springhill Suites Hotel, East side of Rochester, South of Big Beaver (Parcels 88-20-27-228-009, -010, -017, -018 and 88-20-27-227-017), Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver), GB (General Business) and P (Vehicular Parking) Zoning Districts

Mr. Carlisle gave a report on the Springhill Suites Hotel application. He addressed the challenges of the site as relates to the three frontages, site access, landscaping, elevations and transparency. Mr. Carlisle noted the applicant is seeking a deviation in the number of trees required in the parking lot and is asking for consideration of alternative screening required along Owendale and Henrietta. Mr. Carlisle said revised elevations to address the amount of E.I.F.S material were provided by the applicant but not in time for review prior to tonight's meeting.

Mr. Carlisle expressed overall support of the demolition of underutilized properties for the proposed development and finds the site plan to be a workable solution to a very challenging site, but he recommends the item be postponed to allow the applicant to address items noted in his report dated March 8, 2019, as well as any comments received by the Planning Commission and public.

Project Engineer Andrew Andre of Stellar Development LLC addressed the challenges of the site, site arrangement, site access, stormwater management, deficiencies in landscape requirements and architectural design features.

There was discussion on:

- Demand for hotels; number of existing and approved hotels, update from hotel consultant.
- Building entrances; primary in rear, functional patio entry off of Rochester.
- Transparency as relates to three frontages.
- Location as relates to Gateway to the City, I-75 Interstate, required setbacks.
- Building materials, colors, dimensional architectural design features.
- 3-D renderings, in context to I-75 area.
- Corporate hotel design (departure from).

Chair Faison opened the Public Hearing.

- Steve Deluca, 2464 Norton Lawn; owner of two adjacent properties east on Henrietta; addressed concerns with building height, lighting, isolation of his properties, not a fit for the neighborhood.
- Carolin Mann-Bomar, 1059 Owendale, program director for Breaking Barriers Rehabilitation Center; expressed concerns with safety of their patients in parking lot.
- Stacey Pilut, 3652 Millay; asked if a traffic study was conducted, addressed concerns with existing traffic on Big Beaver.

Chair Faison closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Savidant said a traffic study was submitted by the applicant and it was reviewed by OHM, the City’s Traffic Consultant.

There was discussion on:

- Building height.
- Existing traffic congestion.

Stephen Dearing of OHM Advisors addressed the beginning stages of the I-75 Interstate improvements. He said the improvements will reduce traffic backups and provide relief of the existing traffic congestion. He addressed the functionality of Henrietta and Owendale as access drives and the use of the Owendale strip for overflow parking. Mr. Dearing stated there would be minimal overlap in the parking lot for hotel guests and patients of the rehabilitation center.

**Resolution # PC-2019-03-022**

Moved by: Krent  
 Support by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Articles 8 and 9 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Springhill Suites Hotel and accessory parking lot located on the south side of Owendale, East of Rochester, south Big Beaver, Section 27, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver), GB (General Business) and P (Vehicular Parking) Zoning Districts, be postponed.

Yes: All present (6)  
 Absent: Apahidean, Lambert, Tagle

**MOTION CARRIED**

**OTHER BUSINESS**

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – Items on Current Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

8. **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

There were general Planning Commission comments.

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 9:51 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Carlton Faison, Chair

---

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

C:\Users\bob\Documents\Kathy\COT Planning Commission Minutes\2019\2019 03 12 Regular Meeting\_Draft.doc